Writing in an Era of High Standards

Leadership II - Grades 6–12 - Day 1
I feel like a visitor in my own school—that hasn’t changed,” Samantha said, confusion and despair in her voice. We were at the tail end of a focus group discussion with African American students at Green Hills High, a predominantly white, economically diverse school. We had been invited to conduct an equity assessment, examining the extent to which Green Hills was an equitable learning environment for all. We had asked Samantha and a small group of her classmates how they would characterize their school’s two-year-old Multicultural Curriculum Initiative, touted by school administrators as a comprehensive effort to infuse a multicultural perspective into all aspects of school life.

“Oh, I’m invisible,” Sean added, “but also hypervisible. Maybe twice a year there’s a program about somebody’s food or music, but that’s about it. I don’t see the purpose.”

Then Cynthia, who had remained quiet through most of the hourlong discussion, slammed her fist on the table, exclaiming, “That multicultural initiative means nothing. There’s no racism at this school, and nobody’s doing anything about it!”

We found ourselves only a few moments later in our next scheduled focus group, surrounded by the school’s power brokers: the principal, assistant principals, deans, and department chairs. Still taken—maybe even a little shaken—by what we had heard from the young women and men who felt fairly powerless at Green Hills, we asked the administrators about the purpose of the Multicultural Curriculum Initiative.

After a brief silence, Jonathan, the principal, leaned back in his chair. We had observed him over the past few days interacting with students, and it was clear he cared deeply about them. The Multicultural Curriculum Initiative was his brainchild, his baby. Jonathan decorated his office door with quotes about diversity and his office walls with artwork depicting diverse groups of youth. “We see diversity as our greatest asset. That’s what this initiative is all about. What we aim to do here,” he explained with measured intensity, “is to celebrate the joys of diversity.” When we shared with Jonathan the concerns raised by the African American students, he appeared confused and genuinely concerned. “They said that?” he asked, before interrupting a member of his leadership team who had begun to defend the initiative. “Maybe it’s time to rethink this.”

Beyond Artwork and Celebrations

If we’ve learned anything working with schools across the United States, it’s this: When it comes to education equity, the trouble is not a lack of...
multicultural programs or diversity initiatives in schools. Nor is it necessarily a lack of educators who, like Jonathan, appreciate and even champion diversity. In virtually every school we visit, we see attempts at multiculturalism: corridors lined with flags, student-designed posters representing the national or ethnic origins of families in the community, anti-bullying programs, or faculty positions like “Diversity Director.”

The trouble lies in how so many diversity initiatives avoid or whitewash serious equity issues. It lies in the space between what marginalized students like Cynthia say their schools need to do to help them feel less marginalized and what many of the adults in those schools are comfortable doing in the name of multiculturalism.

To better grasp this, put yourself in Cynthia’s shoes. Imagine a world in which, as a result of something over which you have no control—say, your racial identity, sexual orientation, or home language—you’re made to feel alienated or invisible at school. Imagine that when you occasionally see little shimmers of yourself reflected in the curriculum, your identity or culture is reduced to a stereotype—to a sari, taco, or polka. Imagine the
glimmer of excitement you might feel about the possibility that, when the teacher mentions Martin Luther King Jr., a real conversation about racism or poverty might ensue, only to find that even he has been sanitized down to I have a dream. Imagine experiencing racism, sexism, or class inequality in the present while hearing about it in school only in the past tense.

What would it feel like, given those circumstances, to be pressed into par-

illusion of multicultural learning even as they guarantee a lack of sophisticated multicultural learning.

What we are suggesting is that at the heart of a curriculum that is meaningfully multicultural lie principles of equity and social justice—purposeful attention to issues like racism, homophobia, sexism, and economic inequality. Without this core, what we do in the name of multiculturalism can border on exploitative: asking students and families who experience these inequalities to allow students and families who don’t experience them to grow their knowledge, while the inequalities themselves go unaddressed. There’s racism at this school, and nobody’s doing anything about it!

Overcoming the “Culture” Fetish
In her article, “It’s Not the Culture of Poverty, It’s the Poverty of Culture,” Gloria Ladson-Billings (2006) explains how culture fetishism undermines education equity. “Culture,” she explains, “is randomly and regularly used to explain everything” (p. 104). It’s used, in effect, as a stand-in for race, class, language, and other issues that aren’t as comfortably discussed as broad, vague “cultures.”

Many of the most popular frameworks for creating more inclusive classrooms and curriculums continue this culture fetish. In addition to multiculturalism, we have intercultural and cross-cultural education, cultural competence and cultural proficiency, culturally relevant pedagogy, and culturally responsive teaching. And despite the fact that social scientists debunked the concept in the early 1970s, the “culture of poverty” remains the dominant framework in U.S. education circles for understanding the lives of low-income students.

Of course, some focus on culture is warranted. Culture is an important aspect of student experience to consider in efforts to create a meaningfully multicultural curriculum and a more equitable school. Moreover, some of these frameworks, including cultural relevance and cultural responsiveness, are rooted in principles of equity (Ladson-Billings, 1995). The challenge is to retain principles of equity as central aspects of a multicultural curriculum that is truly meaningful, even if—especially if—it feels easier or safer to home in on more simplistic notions of culture.

Embracing Equity Literacy
In our own teaching, as well as in our work with schools and school districts, we embrace a framework for both multicultural curriculum development and bigger efforts to create equitable classrooms and schools. We call this framework equity literacy. Its central tenet is that any meaningful approach to diversity or multiculturalism relies more on teachers’ understandings of equity and inequity and of justice and injustice than on their understanding of this or that culture (Gorski, 2013). It relies, as well, on teachers’ abilities to cultivate in students a robust understanding about how people are treated by one another and by institutions, in addition to a general appreciation of diversity (Swalwell, 2011). The idea is to place equity, rather than culture, at the center of the diversity conversation.

Key to developing equity literacy for educators and students is cultivating
four abilities (Gorski, 2013). These include the ability to
- **Recognize** even subtle forms of bias, discrimination, and inequity.
- **Respond to** bias, discrimination, and inequity in a thoughtful and equitable manner.
- **Redress** bias, discrimination, and inequity, not only by responding to interpersonal bias, but also by studying the ways in which bigger social change happens.
- **Cultivate and sustain** bias-free and discrimination-free communities, which requires an understanding that doing so is a basic responsibility for everyone in a civil society.

Part of the difficulty with implementing a curriculum that grows these abilities in young people is that we educators must first grow them in ourselves. We might start by ensuring that professional development related to multiculturalism focuses not only on cultural competence or diversity awareness, but also on recognizing sexism and ableism, for example; not on a mythical “culture of poverty,” but on responding to economic inequality; and not on how to help marginalized students fit into school cultures they experience as alienating, but on how to redress the alienation by making changes in our own practices and policies.

We recognize this is a daunting task, and we understand the pressure of feeling here’s one more thing I need to squeeze into an already packed workday. But then we remember Cynthia’s exhortation: “There’s racism at this school, and nobody’s doing anything about it!” We don’t have control over everything, but to the extent that we do influence the curriculum, we feel an urgency to avoid the kind of well-intended complacency we found at Green Hills High.

The good news is that there are many powerful models for what a curriculum oriented around equity literacy looks like in practice (see “Great Equity Literacy Resources,” p. 39). Teacher-led organizations around the United States have developed rich databases of curriculums that can (and should) be modified for local contexts. Nobody needs to start from scratch.

**Five Guiding Principles**

It can be difficult to paint a precise picture of what an equity literacy curriculum looks like because, like all curriculums, it will look different depending on contextual factors. What we can say is that, rather than a list of facts or historical figures that everyone should know (as in E. D. Hirsch’s “cultural literacy” lists), an equity literacy curriculum focuses on essential questions like these: What makes something equitable or inequitable? What (local, regional, global) inequities exist? How have they changed over time, and why? What individual and collective responsibilities do we have to address them? These questions require both evidence and ethics to debate. They fit well with the inquiry approach to education promoted by recent curriculum frameworks, such as the College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) framework. As we plan curriculum for our students and work to develop our own skills and knowledge related to equity literacy, it’s useful to keep the following five principles in mind.

**Principle 1. Equity literacy is important in every subject area.** When we teach with and for equity literacy, we’re not abandoning content. Rather, we’re teaching content (when feasible) through an equity lens. One of our favorite resources for teaching through an equity literacy lens is Eric Gutstein and Bob Peterson’s *Rethinking Mathematics* (Rethinking Schools, 2013). In it, these educators provide multiple examples of teaching math in a way that develops students’ mathematical abilities while also helping them see math as a powerful analytical tool for addressing social problems.

For instance, students can develop formulas for how best to calculate a living wage, examine historical trends in wealth and poverty, or map income data in their own communities. Their
findings can become fertile ground for rich discussions, deliberations, and debates about the nature of economic inequality.

**Principle 2. The most effective equity literacy approach is integrative and interdisciplinary.**

It’s easy to see how equity literacy naturally favors interdisciplinary inquiry. As we see in the math example above, students would also engage with reading, writing, speaking, history, and civics.

Science, technology, engineering, and the arts similarly could be tapped as students grapple with real-world equity issues in their communities. Sánchez (2014) describes an interdisciplinary project in which teams of students at a high-poverty school examined challenges in their racially segregated and economically strained community. One group, the Park Fixers, was frustrated “with having insufficient and unsafe equipment for students to play on during recess” (p. 185). Group members were also concerned that the children who lived in an adjacent low-income housing project had no place to play.

With guidance from teachers, the Park Fixers applied a wide variety of skills and an impressive depth of knowledge to address this community challenge they had identified. The students used video and still photography to document the conditions of the park. They used language arts and math skills to craft community surveys, distribute them, and analyze the results. They practiced communication skills by composing and sending letters to several key community members. They even worked with an urban design specialist who helped them capture their vision for a new park in blueprints. Finally, they delivered both oral and written reports to their teachers that incorporated all the material they had gathered.

**Teachers considering similar approaches shouldn’t feel discouraged if students don’t see the fruits of their efforts within the school year.**

As Schultz (2008) notes, “spectacular things happen along the way” when students are engaged in this kind of work; the process is just as important—if not more important—than the actual outcome of their efforts.

By engaging students in this way, the teachers modeled equity literacy. They acknowledged what the students knew all along—that they were targets of bias and inequity. What was happening to their park wasn’t happening to the parks in wealthier neighborhoods. The teachers also helped strengthen students’ equity literacy by integrating lessons about math, writing, and other subjects with an opportunity to apply academic skills to redress this inequity. Cultivating equity literacy is most effective when it’s integrated into the broader curriculum rather than segregated into disconnected activities and when it’s a schoolwide commitment rather than isolated in one or two teachers’ classrooms.

**Many initiatives present the illusion of multicultural learning even as they guarantee a lack of sophisticated multicultural learning.**

Teachers considering similar approaches shouldn’t feel discouraged if students don’t see the fruits of their efforts within the school year. As Schultz (2008) notes, “spectacular things happen along the way” when students are engaged in this kind of work; the process is just as important—if not more important—than the actual outcome of their efforts.

By engaging students in this way, the teachers modeled equity literacy. They acknowledged what the students knew all along—that they were targets of bias and inequity. What was happening to their park wasn’t happening to the parks in wealthier neighborhoods. The teachers also helped strengthen students’ equity literacy by integrating lessons about math, writing, and other subjects with an opportunity to apply academic skills to redress this inequity. Cultivating equity literacy is most effective when it’s integrated into the broader curriculum rather than segregated into disconnected activities and when it’s a schoolwide commitment rather than isolated in one or two teachers’ classrooms.

**Principle 3. Students of all ages are primed for equity literacy.**

Did we mention that the Park Fixers were 3rd graders? The most common rebuke we hear when we talk about equity literacy goes something like this: My students are too young to talk about that stuff. If you’re thinking the same thing, consider this: Even preschool-age children have been exposed to socializing messages about themselves and one another—often even at school. Many students already knowingly experience bias and discrimination, and those who don’t often learn that it’s impolite to mention any distinctions. For example, researchers have found that children as young as three or four already differentiate racial categories—they’re not, as we may want to believe, “color-blind” (Olson, 2013; Winkler, 2009).

So when we say or think that students are “too young” to talk about issues like racism, it’s important that we stop and reflect on whom, exactly, we’re trying to protect. Are we protecting the students who are experiencing racial bias by sidestepping conversations about race, even as we ask them to celebrate diversity?

In our experience, the younger we start, the better. By integrating issues of equity into the content at young ages, we help all students develop the skills and language they need to explore complex and controversial issues in a community of people who may disagree about what’s going on or what should be done about it. Equally important, we demonstrate to students who are the targets of bias and inequity that their experiences matter, and we offer them an opportunity to challenge their peers’ misperceptions. As a result, they may experience the more celebratory, surface-level multicultural initiatives as safer and more legitimate. Meanwhile, students who enjoy more privileged identities become better able to interpret the
stereotypes and biases that feed any misperceptions they might have about the more marginalized people in their communities.

**Principle 4. Students from all backgrounds need equity literacy.**
Many of the common examples of equity literacy in action come from high-poverty schools serving large percentages of students of color and nonnative speakers of English. Unfortunately, this can lead some people to believe that white and wealthy students wouldn’t benefit from a curriculum informed by equity literacy. In fact, these students may have the steepest learning curves when it comes to learning about bias, discrimination, and inequity. Traditional forms of multicultural education that focus on celebrating diversity rather than equity can reinforce their misunderstandings by feeding the assumption that celebrating diversity is enough—that everybody is starting on a level playing field.

A growing body of research provides helpful examples of how to engage more privileged students in an equity literacy curriculum (Swalwell, 2013). In one elite K–8 private school, teachers meet regularly in professional development study groups focused on race, gender, and social class to design curriculum and share their work. While the 8th grade teachers have asked their students to examine real-world historical and contemporary wealth gap data, the 4th grade teachers are inviting their students to share, in journal entries, what they know about being rich and poor, and the kindergarten teacher is designing a simple simulation of unequal distribution of resources.

The teachers are also compiling a list of formal and informal ways that class advantage goes unchecked at their school—for example, how morning meeting questions can sometimes invite students to brag about their material possessions. The teachers’ ultimate goal is to help students do more than simply “be nice” to people with less privilege; they want their students to understand the issues involved and commit to working toward a society with less economic inequality.

**Great Equity Literacy Resources**

Here are some of our favorite—and free—resources for an equity literacy curriculum:

- EdChange (www.edchange.org/multicultural/teachers.html)
- Education for Liberation Lab (www.edliberation.org/resources/lab)
- GLSEN (http://glsen.org/educate/resources/curriculum)
- New York Collective of Radical Educators (www.nycore.org/curricula)
- SoJust (www.sojust.net)
- Teachers for Social Justice (www.teachersforjustice.org/search/label/all%20curriculum)
- Teaching Economics As If People Mattered (www.teachingeconomics.org)
- Teaching for Change (www.teachingforchange.org)
- Teaching Tolerance (www.tolerance.org/classroom-resources)
- Zinn Education Project (http://zinnedproject.org)

**Principle 5. Teaching for equity literacy is a political act—but not more so than not teaching for equity literacy.**
Another common rebuke we hear is that teaching for equity literacy introduces views about social justice into the curriculum that don’t belong in school. But is teaching about poverty or sexism more political than pretending that poverty and sexism don’t exist by omitting them from the curriculum? How might we explain the politics of not teaching about these issues when many of our students are experiencing them, even within school? How can we prepare youth to be active participants in a democracy without teaching them about the most formidable barriers to an authentic democracy?

According to Hess and McAvoy (2014), there’s no silver bullet for engaging students in discussions about important and often controversial issues, but rather a series of factors that teachers must weigh to introduce these issues ethically and responsibly. It’s important for teachers to consider when to withhold or disclose their personal views and how to frame issues in relation to their students, the subject matter they’re teaching, and the community.

Ultimately, Hess and McAvoy conclude, classrooms should directly engage students in answering the question, How should we live together? It’s a nonpartisan question like its empirical cousin, How do we live together? but a deeply political one that’s essential in a diverse society based on democratic principles and committed to equity.

**A More Meaningful Investment**
As Cynthia taught us (“There’s racism at this school, and no one’s doing anything about it!”), students who feel marginalized in our schools may experience what we thought to be meaningful multicultural curriculums
as a purposeful avoidance of a more serious reality. When we invest our multicultural energies in surface-level cultural exchanges, fantasies of color-blindness, or celebrations of white-washed heroes while ignoring the actual inequities many of our students face, we demonstrate an implicit complicity with those inequities.

We can avoid these pitfalls by building our multicultural curriculum efforts, not around cultural awareness or cultural diversity, but around the cultivation of equity literacy in both ourselves and our students.

References


Paul C. Gorski (gorski@edchange.org) is associate professor of Integrative Studies at George Mason University, Fairfax, Virginia, and founder of EdChange (www.edchange.org). His most recent book, coauthored with Seema Pothini, is Case Studies on Diversity and Social Justice Education (Routledge, 2014). Katy Swalwell (swalwell@iastate.edu) is an assistant professor in the School of Education at Iowa State University. She is the author of Educating Activist Allies: Social Justice Pedagogy with the Suburban and Urban Elite (Routledge, 2013).
Framing a Writing Task: The Metacognitive Process

**Your Task:** Read the Student Task and directions. Develop an outline for this argument as if you were going to write it.

**Student Task:**

**Topic:** Should companies be allowed to track consumers’ shopping or other preferences without their permission?

**Task:** Carefully read each of the four texts provided. Then, using evidence from at least three of the texts, write a well-developed argument regarding companies being allowed to track consumers’ shopping or other preferences without their permission. Clearly establish your claim, distinguish your claim from alternate or opposing claims, and use specific, relevant, and sufficient evidence from at least three of the texts to develop your argument. Do not simply summarize each text.

**Outline:**
Cell Phone Carrier Marketing Techniques
An Invasion of Privacy?

BOSTON (CBS) – Your cell phone may be spying on you.

Every time you download an app, search for a website, send a text, snap a QR code or drive by a store with your GPS on, you are being tracked by your cell phone company.

“They know you were playing Angry Birds. They know that you drove by Sears. They know you drove by Domino’s Pizza. They can take that and take a very unique algorithm¹ that can focus on your behavior,” explained marketing expert Mark Johnson. “It’s very impactful.”

According to Johnson, your data trail is worth big money to the cell phone companies. Details about your habits, your age and gender are compiled and can be sold to third parties. The information is predominantly used as a marketing tool so advertisers can target you with products or services that you are more likely to use or want.

The idea does not sit well with smartphone user Harrine Freeman. “It does seem creepy that companies are collecting all this information about consumers,” she said.

Freeman is so uneasy; she turns off her GPS when she is not using it. She also clears her browser history.

“I think it is an invasion of privacy,” she said.

All of the major cell phone carriers admit to collecting information about its customers. Some in the industry argue it benefits consumers because they get ads that are relevant to them.

Cell phone companies do notify customers about the data they collect, but critics say the notices are often hard to understand and written in fine print.

Rainey Reitman of the Electronic Frontier Foundation doesn’t like the fact that those who don’t want to be tracked have to go out of their way to get the company to stop.

“This is something that consumers are automatically opted into,” Reitman said.

To find out how your cell phone company might be monitoring you, be sure to carefully read the privacy policy.

Also, make sure you read all of the updates your carrier might send you because this tracking technology keeps changing.

—Paula Ebben


¹Algorithm — process or set of rules followed in calculations
Text 2

EyeSee You and the Internet of Things:
Watching You While You Shop

...Even the store mannequins have gotten in on the gig. According to the Washington Post, mannequins in some high-end boutiques are now being outfitted with cameras that utilize facial recognition technology. A small camera embedded in the eye of an otherwise normal looking mannequin allows storekeepers to keep track of the age, gender and race of all their customers. This information is then used to personally tailor the shopping experience to those coming in and out of their stores. As the Washington Post report notes, “a clothier introduced a children’s line after the dummy showed that kids made up more than half its mid-afternoon traffic... Another store found that a third of visitors using one of its doors after 4 p.m. were Asian, prompting it to place Chinese-speaking staff members by the entrance.”

At $5,072 a pop, these EyeSee mannequins come with a steep price tag, but for storeowners who want to know more—a lot more—about their customers, they’re the perfect tool, able to sit innocently at store entrances and windows, leaving shoppers oblivious to their hidden cameras. Italian mannequin maker Almax SpA, manufacturer of the EyeSee mannequins, is currently working on adding ears to the mannequins, allowing them to record people’s comments in order to further tailor the shopping experience. ...

It’s astounding the amount of information—from the trivial to the highly personal—about individual consumers being passed around from corporation to corporation, all in an effort to market and corral potential customers. Data mining companies collect this wealth of information and sell it to retailers who use it to gauge your interests and tailor marketing to your perceived desires.

All of the websites you visit collect some amount of information about you, whether it is your name or what other sites you have visited recently. Most of the time, we’re being tracked without knowing it. For example, most websites now include Facebook and Twitter buttons so you can "like" the page you are viewing or "Tweet" about it. Whether or not you click the buttons, however, the companies can still determine which pages you’ve visited and file that information away for later use. ...

As the EyeSee mannequins show, you no longer even have to be in front of your computer to have your consumer data accessed, uploaded, stored and tracked. In August 2012, for example, data mining agency RedPepper began testing a service known as Facedeals in the Nashville, Tennessee area. Facial recognition cameras set at the entrances of businesses snap photos of people walking in, and if you’ve signed up to have a Facedeals account via your Facebook, you receive instant coupons sent to your smartphone. Similarly, a small coffee chain in San Francisco, Philz Coffee, has installed sensors at the front door of their stores in order to capture the Wi-Fi signal of any smartphone within 60 yards. Jacob Jaber, president of Philz Coffee, uses the information gleaned from these sensors to structure his stores according to the in-store behavior of customers. ...

Not even politicians are immune to the lure of data mining. In the run-up to the 2012 presidential election, the Romney and Obama campaigns followed voters across the web by installing cookies on their computers and observing the websites they visited in an attempt to gather information on their personal views. CampaignGrid, a Republican affiliated firm, and Precision Network, a Democratic affiliated firm, both worked to collect data on 150 million American Internet users, or 80% of the registered voting population. ...

—John W. Whitehead
excerpted
https://www.rutherford.org, December 17, 2012
Where Will Consumers Find Privacy Protection from RFID's?: A Case for Federal Legislation

What Are RFID's? How Do RFID's Work?

...RFID [Radio Frequency Information Device] technology is an automatic identification system that identifies objects, collects data, and transmits information about the object through a “tag.” A device called a reader extracts and processes the information on the tag. Experts characterize RFID's as devices “that can be sensed at a distance by radio frequencies with few problems of obstruction or misorientation.” In essence, RFID's are wireless barcodes. However, unlike typical barcodes, which are identical for all common products, each RFID has a unique identification. Therefore, every individually tagged item has a different barcode sequence. Typical barcodes also require unobstructed paths for scanning, whereas RFID's can be scanned through solid objects. RFID's have communication signals that facilitate data storage on RFID tags and enable the stored information to be gathered electronically—hypothetically permitting, for example, Coca-Cola to have a database storing information about the life cycle of a Coke can. The database would contain tracking details from the moment the can is manufactured through its processing at a garbage dump—since RFID readers can be attached to garbage trucks. Between the birth and death of a customer's Coke can, the RFID tags would tell the Coca-Cola Company where and when the Coke was purchased, what credit card the Coke was purchased with, and, in turn, the identity of the purchaser. Even if the customer did not purchase the Coke with a credit card, state issued ID cards equipped with RFID technology could relay the customer's identity to RFID readers as he or she leaves the store. Coca-Cola's final product of the RFID's communications is a database of the life cycles of individual cans of Coke and personal information about their purchasers. With this myriad of information, Coca-Cola has the ability to individually market to each of the 1.3 billion daily Coca-Cola consumers. ...

How Are RFID's Used?

RFID's are currently used in many ways, including, “livestock management[,] 24 hour patient monitoring[,] authentication of pharmaceuticals[,] tracking consignments in a supply chain[,] remote monitoring of critical components in aircraft[,] and monitoring the safety of perishable food.” Advocates of RFID technology, including retailers and manufacturers, praise the increased functionality and efficiency that will likely ensue from using RFID's. Once all products are individually tagged, shoppers are expected to be able to purchase items without checking-out. This should be possible since RFID readers will be able to scan every item as the customer exits the store and charge an RFID credit card, thereby simultaneously increasing efficiency and possibly reducing shoplifting. Other RFID uses include easy monitoring of product recalls, tracking lobsters for conservation purposes, and purchasing products with transaction-free payment systems. Additionally, in October 2003, the Department of Defense set standards mandating suppliers to place


2Pl


4David Plaut, Everything with Chips!, BUS. L. REV., Mar. 2006, 73, 73.
RFID tags on all packaging for the Department of Defense.\textsuperscript{5} Thus, RFIDs can be used to increase efficiency and safety. …

Do Consumers Have a Right to Privacy from RFIDs under Tort Law?\textsuperscript{6}

…In the context of RFIDs, there are some situations where gathering information from RFID tags violates consumers' privacy expectations. For example, a consumer does not have a reasonable expectation of privacy when carrying RFID equipped items in a transparent shopping cart. However, once the items are placed in an opaque bag, a right to privacy immediately arises. If a business or third-party gathers data about the items once the items are no longer visible to the naked eye, there is an objective invasion of privacy. Gathering information stored in the RFID tag in a winter jacket worn in public is also not an invasion of privacy, yet pulling data off undergarments is intrusive. However, since the home is always considered a private place, once an active RFID tag enters the home, any information gathered, including information from the winter jacket, immediately offends the principles of privacy. Protecting consumers from unreasonably intrusive actions of businesses requires that RFID tags become unreadable once they enter private places.

However, the fundamental nature of the technology does not harmonize with this privacy goal because RFID readers do not scrutinize whether the information is considered private before it gathers data from the tag. …

With new technologies come new methods of consumer tracking and changing parameters for what may be considered highly offensive. These new methods of tracking are not considered intrusive simply because the nature of the technology requires consumer purchases to be recorded. If individuals make active decisions to use a credit card instead of cash—a voluntary act—their purchases can be tracked. Similarly, the gathering of information stored on RFID technology in consumer goods may not be deemed highly offensive depending on changing consumer expectations. …

—Serena G. Stein
excerpted and adapted
Duke Law & Technology Review, 2007, No.3


\textsuperscript{6}Tort Law — covers civil wrongs resulting in an injury or harm constituting the basis for a claim by the injured person.
RFID Consumer Applications and Benefits

One of the first consumer applications of RFID was automated toll collection systems, which were introduced in the late 1990s and caught on in the 1990s. An active transponder is typically placed on a car's or truck's windshield. When the car reaches the tollbooth, a reader at the booth sends out a signal that wakes up the transponder on the windshield, which then reflects back a unique ID to the reader at the booth. The ID is associated with an account opened by the car owner, who is billed by the toll authority. Consumers spend less time fumbling for change or waiting on lines to pay their toll fee.

In the late 1990s, ExxonMobil (then just Mobil) introduced Speedpass, an RFID system that allows drivers who have opened an account to pay for gas automatically. Drivers are given a small, passive 13.56 MHz transponder in a small wand or fob that can be put on a key chain. To pay for gas, they just wave the key fob by a reader built into the gas pump. Seven million people in the United States use the system, and it has increased the number of cars each gas station can serve during rush periods. …

RFID has other consumer applications, besides being a convenient payment system. One is the recovery of lost or stolen items. A company called Snagg in Palo Alto, Calif., has created an electronic registry for musical instruments. It provides an RFID tag that can be affixed to a classic guitar or priceless violin and keeps a record of the serial number in the tag. If the instrument is recovered by the police after being lost or stolen, they can call Snagg, which can look up the rightful owner. …

Merloni Elettrodomestici, an Italian appliance maker, has created a smart washing machine. When you drop your clothes in the machine, an RFID reader in the appliance can read the tags in the clothes (if your clothes have tags) and wash the clothes based on instructions written to the tag.

Whether smart appliances with RFID readers catch on depends on how long it takes for RFID tags to become cheap enough to be put into packaging for items. It also depends on whether consumers find RFID-enabled products convenient enough to accept the potential invasion of privacy that comes with having RFID tags in products. But RFID will certainly have a positive impact on people's lives in less direct ways.

One area of importance is product recalls. Today, companies often need to recall all tires, meat or drugs if there is a problem to ensure people's safety. But they can never be sure they recovered all the bad goods that were released into the supply chain. With RFID, companies will be able to know exactly which items are bad and trace those through to stores. Customers that register their products could be contacted individually to ensure they know something they bought has been recalled. …

And RFID should enable consumers to get more information about the products they want to purchase, such as when the items were made, where, whether they are under warranty and so on. When RFID tags are eventually put on the packaging of individual products, consumers will be able to read the tag with a reader embedded in a cell phone or connected to a computer and download data from a Web site. They'll be able to learn, for example, whether the steak they are about to buy is from an animal that was raised organically in the United States. Some companies will be reluctant to share this information, but smart companies will provide it to their customers to build trust and loyalty.
RFID could also have a [sic] positive impact on our environment by greatly reducing waste. The main reason many companies want to use RFID is to better match supply and demand and to make sure that products are where they are supposed to be. If successful, there should be fewer products that are thrown away because no one wants to buy them or they pass their sell-by date (it’s estimated that 90 percent of all food harvested in the United States is never eaten).

RFID tags could also help improve our environment by identifying hazardous materials that should not be dumped in landfills. One day, robots at landfills might be equipped with RFID tags, and they might be able to quickly sort through garbage to locate batteries and other items that contain toxic materials. …

—Bob Violino
excerpted
http://www.rfidjournal.com, January 16, 2005
Debriefing the *THINKING* Process and Forming Hypotheses

**Directions:** Think about the steps, from beginning to end, in PREPARING FOR the task and answer the following questions: What are they? What specific reading standards must students have command of to complete this writing task? Where are students going to struggle and make mistakes?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Steps</th>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>Anticipated Trip-ups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Dimensions, Features, and Skills of Academic Language

**CCSS Language Standards**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions</th>
<th>Features</th>
<th>Skills</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Message** *(Knowledge of Language/Discourse/Linguistic Complexity/Craft & Structure)* | ● Clarity & coherence  
● Register for participants & purposes  
● Density of ideas and their relationships  
● Message organization & structure (visuals, paragraphs)  
● Organization of sentences | ● Create a logical flow of and connections between ideas, knowing how ideas develop and need to develop  
● Match language with the purpose of the message (Clear, complete, focused, logical, appropriate to the discipline)  
● Create, clarify, fortify, & negotiate ideas |
| **Sentence** *(Conventions of Standard English)* | ● Sentence structure (compound/complex) & length  
● Transitions & connectives  
● Complex verb tenses and passive voice  
● Pronouns and references | ● Craft sentences to be clear  
● Use of a variety of sentence types to clarify a message and condense information  
● Combine ideas, phrases, and clauses. |
| **Word/Phrase** *(Vocabulary Acquisition & Usage)* | ● Cross-disciplinary terms  
● Figurative expressions & multiple meanings  
● Content vocabulary  
● Affixes, roots, and transformations | ● Choose and use the best words and phrases communicate  
● Figure out the meaning of new words and terms  
● Use and clarify new words to build ideas or create products |

Adapted © 2017 jeffzwiers.org

The world we are living in is changing around us. The individual is no longer the most important unit of society. We are being turned into a collective, in no small part due to the startling disregard for privacy today. Technology is changing, allowing companies and others—interests, big and small, to track our location and mine information, all without our consent. There should be a limit to what these entities can gather on us. The invasion of our lives is simply not worth the apparent benefits.

Cell phones today are a huge source of information for companies seeking to market to us. Not only can companies purchase information about our appearance and interests, but the locations we visit as well (Text 1, lines 4, 9-10). First of all, this comes off as astonishing, even somewhat “creepy” (Text 1, line 10). To think that technology reduces our privacy to near zero, that we are never entirely alone, is potentially terrifying. In addition, collecting this information does not require explicit permission from the subject (Text 1, lines 20-22). Not only can these companies collect personal information, they do so in a way that is essentially hidden from the consumer. There are ways to be notified of privacy policies and to even opt out, but the legal language and fine print used make them very difficult to understand (Text 1, lines 20-21). Why should consumers be required to make such an effort in the name of privacy?

Perhaps an even more startling case of consumer tracking technology is the Eye See, a store mannequin that sees what customers look like and where they go in the store (Text 2, lines 1-5). In this instance a well known and well established piece of advertising collects information about us without our knowledge. It cannot discriminate between a willing participant and a person who desires his/her privacy. The very
nature of this technology makes it an enemy to privacy. The companies using these mannequins would argue that they are trying to "personally tailor the shopping experience" to their customers (Text 2, lines 5-6), however, the way it allows companies to categorize people is wrong. Since it can only see you, the Eye Sea must make assumptions based on appearance. Have we not tried to move away from stereotypes and generalizations? These mannequins now promote such practices, turning customers into nothing more than cattle, who are expected to follow the group.

Finally, an already relatively common device can do what the previous two technologies can do and more. RFIDs, or Radio Frequency Information Devices, can collect location data as well as store certain pieces of information about a product or other subject (Text 3, lines 9-11). The use of these devices is credited with having positive environmental and safety impacts. They can, hypothetically, help with regard to efforts, and good or product recalls (Text 3, lines 9-11, 22-27). Unlike other technologies, however, the very nature of RFIDs prevents the user from opting out entirely, since radio waves cannot discriminate. This opens up an entirely new level of privacy invasion. Not only can products within sight fair games for companies, but RFIDs can also be read from inside otherwise private places, like homes or purses (Text 3, lines 41-48). While this is generally distasteful, it is also an invasion of privacy by law. With this knowledge, it should be entirely possible to limit RFIDs either through compromise with manufacturers or by requiring the consumer's consent to even have one installed.

No benefit or potential upside to data mining technology should be worth a complete invasion of privacy. Consumers, who are
largely unaware of this invasion, should be informed and presented with easy ways to opt out. Technology has progressed so quickly that we must be careful with what we accept.
In today's world companies have ways of marketing their products to specific people. Companies do this by using information gained by tracking consumers while they shop, browse the web, or even use their phones. Such tracking is often performed without consumers being aware that it is occurring and without permission from the consumers for it to be done. Such tracking is definitely an invasion of a person's right to privacy. If informed consent were obtained from people, companies would be able to track those who have voluntarily suspended their privacy rights. Otherwise, companies should not be allowed to track consumers' shopping or other preferences without their permission.

Today's consumers often have access to cell phones, ipads, and computers. While using such devices, people are being tracked, especially since a "data trail is worth big money" to those who can supply information about "people's habits, age, gender, and location to companies."\(^\text{[footnote]}\) A major supplier of such information is a cell phone company. In fact, "all of the major cell phone carriers admit to collecting information about its customers."\(^\text{[footnote]}\) While downloading apps onto phones, accessing the internet, using GPS, or even just making calls and accepting updates, users are "technically" giving consent to be tracked when they accept terms and conditions without reading them carefully or do not pay full attention to privacy policies.

Tracking information is often supplied on fine print, and long documental documents typically do not state that "cookies" will be put on the consumers' devices. In transparency lacking? At least it appears to be hidden.

Moreover, consumers may not even have the opportunity to know that they are being tracked. Some high-end boutiques are starting to use mannequins equipped with cameras that employ "facial recognition"
technology” (Text 2 line 3). While to the companies, it may seem like a great idea to know who frequent their establishments and what they do while there, the recording of people without their permission is often seen as an invasion of privacy. However, justly such surveillance as necessary “to personally tailor the shopping experience to those coming in and out of their stores” (Text 2 line 5-6). That may make some customers happy, but many will not want their personal information, with pictures, stored on a database available to third parties. The manufacture of surveillance mannequins is now working on the development of mannequins that “are a knowing facade which would further challenge the expectation of privacy.”

Shoppers, however, are not just threatened by mannequins. They are also at the mercy of Radio Frequency Identification Devices or RFIDs, as they are called, that track and collect data through tags (Text 3 lines 1-3). Then, a reader extracts and processes the information on the tag (Text 3 line 3). In turn, a tag is a wireless transponder that does not possess any of the limitations of regular barcodes. RFIDs can be read through solid objects and can supply “a different barcode sequence” (Text 3 lines 4-5) for each individual item. Eventually companies hope to move all their products to RFIDs and eliminate checkout lines by having everything charged. This would definitely save time and reduce shopping (Text 3 line 3). But RFIDs go home with consumers, and the home may not still be a “private place when” an active RFID tag enters the home” (Text 3 line 4-5).

In today’s world of cell phones, computers, handheld devices, surveillance systems, and RFIDs, companies are continually seeking new ways to market products specific to consumers. This is their right. However, the practices they employ must respect the privacy rights of consumers. Companies should not be allowed to track consumers’ shopping or other preferences without their permission and this permission must be gained openly and not a product of fine print.
Companies should be permitted to have access to consumer’s spending without their permission. The companies may seem like they are invading their privacy, but they are simply finding better and more efficient ways to help their consumers and profit their business. Tracking consumer spending will help small businesses grow, make the lives of the buyers easier, and improve the environment.

Despite popular belief in the invasion of privacy, companies in today’s society do not aim to intrude your space just to personally know you. Companies track your spending and history to help them grow. They do not care that you are going to a meeting or cannot find your way to a place. Companies only check up on history to find out what their interests are and how to advertise their products so that they fit those interests.

Needless to say, businesses are in it for the money, and they “invade consumers’ privacy” to help profit and expand their company.

Moreover, the allowance to track consumer spending aids small businesses and helps them grow and succeed in the competitive business world today. EyeSee cameras in store mannequins allows stores to see the type of people that shop at their stores. The information that the cameras get allow marketing companies to personally tailor the shopping experience to those coming in and out.
of their stores.” (Text 2, lines 5-6). By their perception of the customers, stores can change their approach to advertising their merchandise so that the buyers are more apt to spending. Stores may also rearrange their departments to fit the desires of the type of people that shop there. (Text 2). Mannequins will increase consumer spending and ultimately profit small businesses.

Furthermore, Radio Frequency Information Devices (RFID) makes the lives of people easier and more simplistic. These RFID cuts out wasted time looking for change or money at toll booths or at the gas stations. Companies such as EZ pass allow drivers to breeze through toll booths without having to stop, get money out, and possibly wait for change. That is too slow in today’s fast-paced world. Instead, RFID came up with this idea to speed up the time spent at the toll booth so that drivers can get to their destination quicker and faster (Text 4). In addition, RFID is used at gas stations. At the pump, consumers can wave a RFID keychain to pay for their gas instead of pulling out a credit card or cash. These keychains also benefit the gas company by increasing the amount of cars served in times of immense traffic (Text 4). Another way RFID helps the lives of others is by tracking lost or stolen items. The active RFID tags can search and find any item that was misplaced or stolen.
From them (Text 4). Nevertheless, RFID better the lives of individuals by no longer wasting their time and finding something that belongs to them. Additionally, tracking consumer spending benefits the environment and people living on earth. RFID can track the life span of a can, which can determine its whereabouts after the consumer drinks it. RFID can track whether the can was recycled or thrown out, and it can promote the use of recycling items such as cans instead of throwing them in garbage dumps (Text 3). Moreover, RFID cuts down on the amount of wasted food in America. By tracking consumer spending, the companies can more accurately meet the needs of supply and demand and cut down on the amount of food that was overproduced (Text 4). In addition, RFID can identify certain objects that should not have been dumped in garbage dumps, and hopefully, provide an easier way to sort these items from appropriate trash.

Companies should track consumer spending because it will aid business, make easier lives, and improve the environment. Despite belief in the invasion of privacy, the look at our lawyers' history proves to help the people of today's world, and the future generations.
In most scenarios, consumers should not be tracked for the
sole benefit of companies without permission. However, if the
consumer does authorize its use by way of contract, companies
should have every right to track them.

When people walk into stores to buy things they need,
they do not expect to be watched in those stores solely for
the things that they buy. People have known about
security cameras for years, but those are high in the air
and primarily focused on keeping the store secure. With
new technology, such as the EyeSee camera and the widespread
use of RFID tags, codes, information about consumers is now
passed directly to companies and advertisers without permission.

Exceptions to this are various techniques that allow
companies to see exactly what kind of people enter what
store at what time. This, combined with RFID readers
at entrances that have the ability to read state-issued ID cards,
credit cards, and even product labels, allow companies to
build databases about who buys their products the most
and attempt to appeal to them. This complete invasion
of privacy is instituted in a very public environment, and
many others are uneasy about this. In other places, like the Internet, tracking technology like cookies combined with
social networking allows many kinds of businesses and groups
to build consumer and participant databases without authorization.

The government is a large offender of this, particularly
the Democratic and Republican Parties during the 2012 election.
Exceptions here are becoming more at an issue,
even in the supposed exclusion of one’s own home. Businesses
Those who do practice consumer authorization, however, still get flack for tracking consumers—specifically, cell phone companies. Businesses like Verizon and T-Mobile actually do tell customers exactly what they are monitoring—data usage, GPS usage, and other various things—because they sell these things and want to make them more efficient and profitable. However, customers still complain about data monitoring, even when they should have read contracts that companies had sent them. (Excerpt: Lines 4-11) For those who complain that their bills are hard to decipher, a quick Google search should allow a user to read their contracts. Also, unlike retail stores and websites, cellphones are entirely optional, and if one company’s policies are too invasive, there are many others. Cellphone companies rely on data monitoring, and since they tell customers what they are doing ahead of time, they should be allowed to. Consumers should understand how their technology works before they complain about how invasive it is, or even sign their name to a legal document to use it.

If privacy invasion is authorized by a consumer, businesses should be able to do so. In the much more prevalent case where consumers do NOT authorize corporate tracking, the technology should NOT be used, and the government needs to put a mandate on this. If the information regarding tracking is not shown to the public, tracking has no right to be instituted at all.
Throughout the years, new innovations in technology have enabled companies to develop a system to monitor goods, consumers, and other objects of concern. These systems may include cell phone usage, internet usage, the goods bought by consumers, or the places that people travel. In some cases, this is seen as an invasion of privacy. However, during the majority of the time, this new technology can be seen as a benefit to both people and the companies affected.

These new innovations in technology have a large impact on people. For example, cell phone companies monitor information about the distribution and usage of their products. One customer feels uneasy and takes extra measures to ensure the safety of her information, but if she doesn’t have anything to hide, then why bother. Most of the data collected is done without the people knowing anyways. In text 1, line 18 it is shown how the monitoring of information is beneficial to the customer because they can then receive ads based off of the data collected. This is not an invasion of privacy because the customers are notified in one
way or another. This same idea is seen with internet usage as every single website visited collects some sort of information about the usage of their sites. The monitoring of internet usage is also beneficial as the people may receive coupons based upon the businesses you travel to (text 1, line 33). Most items that are tracked only if the consumer moves a conscious to use something such as a credit card. (text 3, line 56). Tracking devices such as RFID tags may not be seen as a threat to privacy because the manufacturers have distinct rules to follow depending on where the tag is located. Energy monitoring people devices are not an invasion of privacy and all of the benefits outweigh the drawbacks. The RFID tags allow customers to gain knowledge of the items being purchased. (text 4, line 35) They also allow companies to track products and inform consumers about hazardous items and recalls. Overall monitoring devices are not an invasion of privacy, and all of the benefits outweigh the drawbacks.

New innovations also have a great impact on companies. Sensors and hidden cameras can be used to monitor customers
within the stores. They can be used to collect information, monitor interests, and help change marketing depending on the data collected. Companies should (text 1, lines 20-21) because it helps the environment by creating a system that wastes less product. (text 4, lines 50-51) Tracking and monitoring devices are convenient, efficient, and they help improve the functionality of many businesses and companies. These are all valid reasons as to why tracking of consumers' shopping should be allowed.

In conclusion, companies should be allowed to track information about consumers and their buying habits as it is beneficial to all involved. The people may gain ads or coupons as a result of this and it may also help ensure their safety against hazards. New technology has increased the efficiency of businesses and companies and makes it so that minimal product is wasted. Overall, new methods of consumer tracking should not be considered intrusive.
Companies should not be permitted to track consumers' shopping and other activities without their consent. Without informing people of new tracking devices and methods and letting them decide, people's privacy is invaded. Companies invade people's personal privacy. Although some people may argue that tracking systems help companies and individuals, doing so without their permission is not right.

When companies do not inform and recognize the opinion of their consumers, people become oblivious, undervalued, and invaded. Most companies use tracking devices for personal and financial benefits. Cell phone companies track information for personal reasons in order to target specific products that are most popular among buyers. Similarly, many stores place cameras on their mannequins to pin point the most commonly sold items. The Airmax Spa mannequin company is working to add "ears" to mannequins to listen to people's comments about products. As a result of these selfish habits, companies invade people's privacy and make them oblivious and uneducational. People are unaware of the hidden cameras and audio devices and unaware that their cell phone companies can track what apps they have bought and where they have traveled. Unlike other tracking devices, RFID, and devices that track solid objects, are not used solely for selfish reasons. They still invade people's privacy, though.

People are unaware that companies know their identities through the products they purchase. Cell phone companies, Facebook, Twitter, and other websites track some information and about each person and store it away without their permission. It is wrong to track people and the things they buy without their agreement.
Although some people may argue that companies’ tracking can benefit society as a whole, I strongly believe that people would feel offended and invaded if they knew the companies’ tactics. Many people see the use of tracking devices as beneficial to the community environmentally, and helpful to save time. Radio Frequency Information Devices are efficient in toll collection systems (text 4, line 4) and when people need to locate lost or stolen items (text 4, line 15), but ultimately invade people’s space and identity. They are efficient but only fair with the consent of the people using them.

Ultimately, companies should not be allowed to track buyers’ activity without their permission. Even though some companies argue that tracking techniques benefit their businesses and their consumers, invading doing so without people’s permission is simply an invasion of privacy.
Companies should be allowed to track consumers' shopping or other preferences. If someone makes a suspicious purchase, then companies should be allowed to track their merchandise. However, if the companies are tracking merchandise without any suspicion, then companies should not be allowed to track their merchandise. It's all about whether the purchase raises reasonable suspicion.

According to Text 3, there is a device called RFID, which is an abbreviation for Radio Frequency Information Device. It is a technology that is used as an identification system that identifies objects, collects data, and transmits information about the object when it is tagged.
As explained in text Cell Phone companies are tracking where people go through use of GPS. I feel uncomfortable to know my Cell Phone company know where I am at all times. I want to have a private life.

Companies also know who is coming into there stores through the use of manigans with camvas. I feel this is invasion of privacy because I would not want a store to know who I am or what I look like.

Companies also invade peoples privacy through RFID's. They can know who you are through RFID's and that isn't fair.
There are a lot of purchasing phone apps, downloading and many more in the world we live today. Technology improves and helps us everyday, technology has advance to a point were us the consumers can be track. Should companies be allowed to track consumer shopping or other preferences without their permission? I disagree. I don’t believe any company should track any consumer for anything.

In text 1 states “When you download an app, search for a website, send a text or drive by a store with your GPS on you are being tracked by your cell phone. This quote goes with my claim because as a consumer myself I would not want to be wireless track how could I feel safe when some companies have my information.”

In text 2 states “According to Washington Post, mannequins in some of the high end boutiques are now being outfitted with cameras that utilize facial recognition technology.” This quote goes with my claim because as a shopper I would not want my photo to be taken. In text 2 it states the reason why they want to have cameras to show the store owner who is going in and out of their store so they can improve business by age, gender, and ethnicity.”
In text 3 states the use of [Radio frequency information Device] (RFID). This technology is an automatic identification system that identifies objects, collects data and transmits information about the object through a tag.

For example in text 3, the Coca-Cola Company can have information of any can, to the purchase from the Store and to the garbage dump. RFID’s can tell the company what you bought, what you have in your house and if it’s wrong, your house shouldn’t be monitor, your house should always be consider a private place.

Should Companies be allowed to track consumers shopping or other preferences without their permission? I disagree I don’t believe in any company should track any consumer for anything.
Technology has made major improvements all over the world. However, these improvements have made it much easier for companies to track consumers without their permission. In my opinion, I believe the tracking of a customer’s habits and observations is an invasion of privacy. I do not agree with modern companies today who believe tracking consumers is right. Modern day companies are always looking for a way to profit off the customer.

In Text 1, it is demonstrated how cell phone providers are invading customer privacy by monitoring every app you download, search or text you make, or drive by a store with your GPS still on (Lines 1-2). In my opinion, it is strange to know that a company is tracking everything I do. Some customers have no idea they are being tracked and are shocked when they find out. I agree with Harrine Freeman in Line 16 when she also claims it is an invasion of privacy. According to Lines 9-10 in Text 1, details about your habits, age, and gender are all compiled and sold to third-party companies. Third-party companies would pay for this information because it could potentially impact them in a positive way.

People who do not want to be tracked have to go out of their way which can sometimes be
Inconvenient to some people (Line 22-23) Text 1.

Text 2 talks about how in some places you are being watched while you shop. In my opinion having mannequins observe you while you shop is creepy to consumers. Some people prefer not to be photographed without permission before hand. In lines 14-16 of Text 2 it talks about improvements to the mannequins by adding ears to them. This is a bad idea because of all the potential information the mannequins can also hear if the customer is having a private conversation with someone they trust. You no longer have to be in front of a computer for your information to be tracked as it said in lines 28-30 of Text 2.

In text 3 it tells how RFID tags can track everything you purchase and also monitor the products journey to see where it ends up (Lines 16-19). The RFID tags can also identify the person who bought each of these items. In my opinion this makes a person not trust companies that can not thrive without the support of its customers.

Lastly I believe tracking consumer habits is a major invasion of privacy which can result in consumer information being leased to other companies. It can also cause a person not to feel safe whenever they buy something from a company that
does so. The major goal of a company is for a customer to buy its products but if a customer does not trust the company that can be hard.
Reflect and Write

Where were your predictions correct, and where were the *ah-ha* moments?

How can we prepare students to move through this process independently?

Why is this an equity practice?
Going Back to the Task

Directions:
- **Step 1**: Reread the prompt to identify and highlight the noun (product) of the task. *What Am I Producing?*
- **Step 2**: Identify and highlight verbs and actions. *What are the steps?*

**Topic**: Should companies be allowed to track consumers’ shopping or other preferences without their permission?

**Task**: Carefully read each of the four texts provided. Then, using evidence from at least three of the texts, write a well-developed argument regarding companies being allowed to track consumers’ shopping or other preferences without their permission. Clearly establish your claim, distinguish your claim from alternate or opposing claims, and use specific, relevant, and sufficient evidence from at least three of the texts to develop your argument. Do not simply summarize each text.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PRODUCT:</th>
<th>ACTION:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Going Back Into the Text as Students: Text 1

### Summary of annotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text 1 – Cell Phone Carrier Marketing Techniques An Invasion of Privacy?</th>
<th>Work with each other to annotate for:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The argument</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The author’s position</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Summarizing paragraphs</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Quotes that support the argument</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Questions about article</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Going Back Into the Text as Students: Text 2

## Summary of annotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text 2 – EyeSee You and the Internet of Things: Watching You While You Shop</th>
<th>Work with each other to annotate for:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The argument</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The author’s position</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Summary of paragraphs</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Quotes that support the argument</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Questions about article</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How does this build or refute the previous argument?
# Going Back Into the Text as Students: Text 3

## Summary of annotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text 3 – Where Will Consumers Find Privacy Protection From RFIDs?: A Case for Federal Legislation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The argument</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The author’s position</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Summarize paragraphs</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Quotes that support the argument</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Questions about article</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Text 3 Considerations

### Summary of annotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text 3: Where Will Consumers Find Privacy Protection From RFIDs?: A Case for Federal Legislation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Objective Summary</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How does this build or refute the previous arguments?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Which would be a smarter argument to make based on this information?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Going Back Into the Text as Students: Text 4

## Summary of annotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Text 4 – RFID Consumer Applications and Benefits</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The argument</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The author’s position</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Summarize paragraphs</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Quotes that support the argument</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Questions about article</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Text 4 Considerations

### Summary of annotation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text 4 – RFID Consumer Applications and Benefits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How does this build or refute the previous arguments?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Which would be a smarter argument to make based on this information?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make your claim: Should companies be allowed to track consumers’ shopping or other preferences without their permission?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Select your three strongest pieces of evidence to support that claim</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Speed Share Claims

Directions:
1. Find someone with the same position.
2. Share your three strongest pieces of evidence and why you chose them.
3. Listen to your partner share their three pieces of evidence and why they chose them (reasoning).
4. Revise your evidence based on your conversation – add reasoning/change reasoning/evidence.
5. Find a new partner.
6. Repeat process
7. Return to seat and revise evidence and reasoning.

Central Claim:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting claims</th>
<th>Evidence</th>
<th>Initial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Speed Share: Listening to Alternate Points of View

Find a partner who has an opposing point of view.

1. What are their three strongest pieces of evidence to support their positions?
2. What is their reasoning?
3. What do you think is their strongest evidence and reasoning?
4. Record their reasoning.
5. Find another partner and repeat.
6. Return to seat.
7. Determine which, if any, counterclaim goes with your argument.
8. Populate your outline.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opposing claim</th>
<th>Strongest Evidence</th>
<th>Reasoning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Partner 1</td>
<td>Partner 1</td>
<td>Partner 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partner 2</td>
<td>Partner 2</td>
<td>Partner 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Reflection on Activity and Process

What does this series of activities afford students in terms of:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Processing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Articulation of position</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Controlling for misunderstandings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Synthesis of other perspectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Which Standards are consistently involved in this process?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What makes this process an equitable teaching practice?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Writing Interdependencies

“First, students process information in a much clearer way when they are required to write an answer. They “write to think” and, thus, gain the opportunity to clarify their own thought processes. Second, teachers have the opportunity to gain rich and complex diagnostic information about why students respond to an academic challenge the way they do….The association between writing and performance in other academic disciplines was striking, and gets to the heart of the curriculum choices that teachers must make.” (Reeves 2000, pp. 189-190).

What additional kinds of writing did students have to engage in during this process?

How did this process reflect this quote?

What changes must be made in curriculum to support this process?
Should companies be allowed to track consumers’ shopping or other preferences without their permission? Many people can see that companies monitoring them is not invasive, but it is beneficial in many ways. Companies should be allowed to track consumers’ shopping or other preferences. It can benefit the company as well as the consumer and the environment. Everyone goes shopping and has cell phones these days, so this issue has become important.

Many people feel that being tracked by companies without giving permission is very invasive of one’s privacy. The fact that just by using a cell phone or GPS, companies can find out where the person has been, how long they were there, how often they visit that place and so on. This idea shown in text one does not sit right with people. They believe it is an invasion of privacy and overall creepy. Although some people may feel this way, many others realize that it can be a good thing and very beneficial in a lot of ways.

People who don’t mind having their personal preferences monitored are helping themselves, companies and the environment. Text one is all about cell phones and how carriers track the data trail from each customer. It is said that “The information is predominantly used as a marketing tool so advertisers can target you with products or
services that you are more likely to use or want." Not only is this helping the company, but the consumer is getting what they want. It helps to get ads that are relevant to that particular person.

Another reason that companies should be allowed to track consumer preferences is because it helps the consumer shopping become highly personal and much easier. Text two tells about mannequins with cameras for eyes that allow storekeepers to keep track of the age, gender and race of all their customers. This would personally tailor the shopping experiences of those coming in and out of the stores.

Also companies should be allowed to track their information because it can benefit the environment. Texts 3 and 4 tell about Radio Frequency Information Devices. These RFID's can be beneficial in many ways. They track food and drug purchases. If toxic things had been thrown out, they can track where to make less pollution. This helps the environment.

Companies should be allowed to track consumer products.
Supplemental Skills: Integrating Evidence from Sources

SUPPLEMENTAL SKILLS INSTRUCTION

WR.1.A ARGUMENT Integrating Evidence from Sources

Lessons WR.1.A–G offer direct instruction on discrete skills and should be implemented between Lessons 10 and 11. Students may benefit from some or all of the instruction in these lessons; only those lessons or activities that address student needs should be implemented.

Introduction

This lesson is composed of four distinct but related activities that center on skills for integrating evidence from sources while using in-text citations. Each activity may last an entire class period.

Writing Instruction Options:

- Paraphrasing
- Integrating Quotations
- Punctuating Quotations
- In-Text Citations

In this lesson, the teacher provides direct instruction to students on how to integrate evidence and citations into arguments in order to maintain the flow of ideas, avoid plagiarism, and follow a standard format for in-text citation. Students learn how to paraphrase text from a source, effectively integrate quotations, punctuate integrated quotations, or include proper in-text citations to avoid plagiarism. Students focus on revising their own argument drafts for well-integrated evidence or proper citations before transitioning to a peer discussion of revisions. Student learning is assessed via the completion of the WR.1 Revision Exit Slip: Integrating Evidence, on which each student records one example of a successful revision.

For homework, students choose three different passages from their arguments and revise each passage focusing on paraphrasing, integrating quotations, punctuating quotations, or in-text citations. Students also write a few sentences explaining whether they will keep the revisions they drafted and the impact this decision has on their arguments.
Appendix 1: Paraphrasing

Explain to students that effective argument writing requires using evidence from sources to fully develop their claims and counterclaims fairly. Explain that students must integrate evidence from other authors into their own arguments by paraphrasing or quoting directly from a source. Explain to students that whether they choose to incorporate evidence by paraphrasing or quoting, they must always give credit to their sources by including a proper citation of the source.

• Students will see and discuss in-text citations as they learn to integrate evidence. See Appendix 4 for instruction on proper in-text citation methods, style, and formatting.

• Differentiation Consideration: If necessary, explain to students that the information about the source inside the parentheses in each of the examples on the handout is called a parenthetical citation.
  ▷ Students write the definition of parenthetical citation in the appropriate section of their vocabulary journals.

Explain to students that when they integrate evidence into their arguments, they may paraphrase text from the original source instead of using direct quotations. To paraphrase means “to rephrase or restate the text in one’s own words without changing the meaning of the text.”

• Students write the definition of paraphrase in the appropriate section of their vocabulary journals.

Instruct students to take out their copies of the article “Attached to Technology and Paying a Price” by Matt Richtel and reread section 3, paragraphs 15–16” (from “At the University of Rochester, researchers found” to “changes into real-world benefits like safer driving”).

• Students silently read section 3, paragraphs 15–16 from “Attached to Technology and Paying a Price.”

Post or project the following examples.

Example 1 is taken from paragraph 4 of the Model Argument (refer to Lesson 10).

• Example 1: One study showed that playing fast-paced video games can improve a person’s reaction time and ability to see details, which are skills that can be applied in the real-world, like when driving (Richtel).

• Example 2: One study showed that “players of some fast-paced video games can track the movement of a third more objects on a screen than nonplayers. They say the games can improve reaction and the ability to pick out details amid clutter,” which researchers are trying “to channel these changes into real-world benefits like safer driving” (Richtel).
Instruct students to Think, Pair, Share about the following questions:

What is similar about the two examples? What is different?

Student responses may include:
- Both examples communicate the same idea from the source.
- Both examples cite the source.
- Example 1 is shorter than Example 2.
- Example 1 paraphrases from the source while Example 2 includes lengthy quotes directly from the source.

Why might a writer choose to paraphrase the text from a source rather than quote it directly?

Student response may include:
- The direct quotation is long and provides information that is not relevant to the writer’s argument.
- The direct quotation requires too many modifications to be integrated into the argument.
- The information in the direct quotation is not organized in the same order as the writer’s logical sequencing, so paraphrasing improves the flow of the argument.
- The writer wants to condense a detailed explanation or description.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct students to return to section 3, paragraphs 15–16 of “Attached to Technology and Paying a Price.” Post or project the following paraphrasing example. Then lead a brief whole-class discussion about the question below.

Example 3: One study showed that players of some quick-moving video games can follow the movement of a third more objects on the screen than those who do not play these games. They say the games can increase reaction time and ability to pick out details, which researchers are trying to channel into real-world benefits like better driving.

Example 3 is not properly paraphrased. Why?

Student responses may include:
- Example 3 uses a lot of words and phrases that are exactly the same as the words and phrases in the text (e.g., “players of some ... the movement of a third more objects” (sec. 3, par. 15)).
- In Example 3, there are several words that are only slightly different from the text and the overall phrasing remains the same. In Example 3, the writer says “players of some quick-
moving video games,” and the original text says “players of some fast-paced video games” (sec. 3, par. 15).

- In Example 3, there is no parenthetical citation.

Explain to students that if they choose to paraphrase text, they cannot use the exact words or phrasing from the source or direct quotations without quotation marks. Inform students that replacing individual words in a quotation with synonyms is also not considered paraphrasing. To paraphrase properly, students should determine the overall meaning of the text they want to paraphrase and then rephrase the idea in their own words. Explain to students that one strategy for proper paraphrasing is to read the section of text that they want to paraphrase and then explain—either through writing or speaking—the idea to their audience without looking back at the section of text.

① Differentiation Consideration: If the skill of paraphrasing is new or challenging to students, consider posting or projecting several quotes from one of the unit’s texts and instructing students to work in pairs or small groups to practice paraphrasing each quote. Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses, noting that there are many acceptable ways to paraphrase a quote.
Appendix 2: Integrating Quotations

Explain to students that as they develop claims and counterclaims in their arguments, they may integrate evidence by using direct quotations from a source text. Explain to students that the first step for integrating quotations is choosing an appropriate quotation that includes relevant and significant evidence for their argument.

Post or project the following quotation from section 1, paragraphs 11–12 of the article “Attached to Technology and Paying a Price” by Matt Richtel and lead a brief whole-class discussion about the question below.

• “While many people say multitasking makes them more productive, research shows otherwise. Heavy multitaskers actually have more trouble focusing and shutting out irrelevant information, scientists say, and they experience more stress.

And scientists are discovering that even after the multitasking ends, fractured thinking and lack of focus persist.”

If a writer wanted to use information from this quotation to support a central claim that the school should participate in “Shut Down Your Screen Week,” what are the most relevant and significant phrases from this quotation and why?

Student responses may include:

- The phrases “research shows,” “scientists say,” (sec. 1 par 11) and “scientists are discovering” (sec. 1, par. 12) are important, because these phrases suggest that the information is credible.
- The phrase “[h]eavy multitaskers actually have more trouble focusing and shutting out irrelevant information” (par. 11) is relevant and significant, because it shows that too much technology use can be harmful to students.
- The phrase “experience more stress” (par. 11) is relevant and important, because it demonstrates the negative effects of too much technology use.
- The phrase “even after the multitasking ends, fractured thinking and lack of focus persist” (par. 12) is relevant and significant, because it shows that the negative effects of too much technology use can be long-lasting.

Explain to students that the second step for integrating quotations is examining the quotation and then selecting the word(s) or phrase(s) that are the most important for supporting their claims.

Post or project the following examples and instruct students to Think, Pair, Share about the questions below.
- **Example 1:** Although “many people say multitasking makes them more productive, research shows otherwise. Heavy multitaskers actually have more trouble focusing and shutting out irrelevant information, scientists say, and they experience more stress” (Richtel).

- **Example 2:** Contrary to popular belief, researchers have demonstrated that multitasking does not make people more productive. Instead, “[h]eavy multitaskers actually have more trouble focusing and shutting out irrelevant information” (Richtel), which means that students who are distracted by their phones, laptops, and TVs at home will not be able to concentrate on doing their homework well.

**What is the same about the way these two examples integrate the same evidence? What is different?**

- Student responses should include:
  - The first example is only one sentence that is composed almost entirely of the quotation from the article, while the second example is three sentences and uses a smaller portion of the quotation from the article.
  - Because it is mostly the quotation from the article, the first example does not include any of the writer’s thoughts, while the second example includes the writer’s thoughts.

**Which example more effectively integrates the evidence to support a claim? Why?**

- Student responses may include:
  - The second example more effectively integrates the evidence, because it first explains the counterclaim that this evidence is refuting, while the first example inserts the quotation without any context.
  - The second example is more effective, because it uses the most relevant and significant information from the quotation rather than including the entire quotation like the first example does. This allows the reader to focus on the most important parts of the evidence.
  - The second example more effectively integrates the evidence, because the sentence after the quotation clarifies why the evidence is important and how it supports a claim about the negative effects of technology use.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses. Explain to students that both examples use quotations from “Attached to Technology and Paying a Price,” but the second example demonstrates how to effectively integrate a quotation into a section of an argument to support a central claim. Explain to students that there are several different ways to integrate quotations into their arguments, but they should always introduce a quotation, then include the important information from a quotation, and finally connect the evidence from the quotation either to other evidence or a claim. Smooth, appropriate integration of evidence is necessary for creating a cohesive argument. In an argument, integrating quotations allows the reader to easily follow the logic of the writer. It allows the reader to “see” the writer’s thinking.
Distribute the Tips for Integrating Quotations Handout. Encourage students to use this handout as a step-by-step review of how to effectively integrate quotations into their arguments.

- Students follow along.

See Appendix 3 for instruction on punctuating integrated quotations.

Tips for Integrating Quotations Handout

Step 1: Select a quotation you would like to integrate into your piece.

- Example: “Wiring up our brains like this makes us adept at filtering information, making snap decisions, and fielding the incoming digital debris, but sustained concentration, reading body language, and making offline friends are skills that are fading away.” (Perez)

Step 2: Select a word, or several words, from that quotation that carry significant ideas.

- Example: “makes us adept at filtering information, making snap decisions, and fielding the incoming digital debris” and “sustained concentration, reading body language, and making offline friends are skills that are fading away” (Perez)

Step 3: Compose a sentence that includes those words and the point you want to make. Include your thoughts to give the quotation context and to connect the quotation back to your argument. There are several ways to do this, and the punctuation rules differ depending on the context.
Appendix 3: Punctuating Quotations

Inform students that using proper punctuation when integrating quotations is essential for creating clarity and establishing credibility. Improper punctuation can hinder the reader’s understanding or make the writing seem unprofessional.

Distribute the Tips for Punctuating Quotations Handout. Instruct students to form pairs or small groups to read through the examples and notes on proper punctuation before and after quotes.

Post or project the examples below of integrated quotations that are improperly punctuated. Instruct student pairs or groups to discuss how to correct each example, referring to their handouts for guidance. Explain to students that each example has one or two errors.

- **Example 1:** Social media does not cause isolation “the average user of a social networking site had more close ties than and was half as likely to be socially isolated as the average American.” (Hampton).
- **Example 2:** Hampton states “social media users knew people from a greater variety of backgrounds,” (Hampton).
- **Example 3:** Research shows that, “the brains of internet [sic] users become more efficient at finding information,” (Richtel) which is a skill that helps students complete their work.
- **Example 4:** It is important for students to participate in activities that do not involve using digital media, like television, because a recent study by the CDC, “found that teenagers’ weight did, in fact, correlate with their screen time.” (Norton).
- **Example 5:** Of course, technology is extremely useful for students, “rote memorization is no longer a necessary part of education,” (Perez) because students have access to facts and figures at their fingertips.

For each example, ask volunteers to share their corrections and explain their decisions.

- **Student responses should include:**
  - **Example 1:** Social media does not cause isolation: “the average user of a social networking site had more close ties than and was half as likely to be socially isolated as the average American” (Hampton).
    - A colon should introduce the quotation, because both the sentence preceding the quotation and the quotation itself are independent clauses. The period should be outside of the quotation marks and after the parenthetical citation.
  - **Example 2:** Hampton states, “social media users knew people from a greater variety of backgrounds” (Hampton).
A comma should introduce the quotation, since the quotation is something the author of the article wrote. There should not be a comma at the end of the quotation.

- **Example 3:** Research shows that “the brains of internet [sic] users become more efficient at finding information” (Richtel), which is a skill that helps students complete their work.
  - No comma should introduce the quotation, since the word “that” precedes the quotation. The comma at the end of the quotation should come after the parenthetical citation.

- **Example 4:** It is important for students to participate in activities that do not involve using digital media, like television, because a recent study by the CDC “found that teenagers’ weight did, in fact, correlate with their screen time” (Norton).
  - No comma should introduce the quotation, because it is not grammatically necessary for the sentence. Even though there is a colon at the end of the quoted text in the original source, it is not grammatically correct to include it in the integrated sentence.

- **Example 5:** Of course, technology is extremely useful for students: “rote memorization is no longer a necessary part of education” (Perez), because students have access to facts and figures at their fingertips.
  - The comma before the quotation should be replaced with a colon, because the clause before the quotation and the quotation itself are both complete sentences. The comma at the end of the quotation should come after the parenthetical citation.

Explain to students that when they integrate quotations into their writing, they may need to make small changes to the quotation so that the reader can easily follow and understand the writer’s thoughts. Post or project the following examples and instruct students to Think, Pair, Share about the questions below.

1. The following examples are taken from paragraphs 2, 3, and 4, respectively, of the Model Argument (refer to Lesson 10).
   - **Example 1:** In fact, as Amy Norton reports in the article “Kids Still Getting Too Much ‘Screen Time’: CDC,” the researchers at the U.S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention found that “nearly three quarters [of teens] spent at least two hours a day watching TV and using a computer.”
   - **Example 2:** Research has shown that “[h]eavy multitaskers actually have more trouble focusing and shutting out irrelevant information . . . and they experience more stress” (Richtel).
Example 3: Perez reports that “our exposure to the net is impacting the way our brains form neural pathways . . . [which] makes us adept at filtering information, making snap decisions, and fielding the incoming digital debris.”

How does the writer modify the text included in the quotation? Why might the writer make these changes?

- Student responses should include:
  - In example 1, the quotation includes the phrase “of teens” in brackets. The original text does not have this phrase. The writer may have added “of teens,” so that the reader understands to whom the rest of the quote refers.
  - In example 2, the word “[h]eavy” has the letter “h” lower case and in brackets. In the original text, this word was at the beginning of the sentence. Because the quote is integrated into a sentence, the writer may have made the letter “h” lower case, since a capital word in the middle of a sentence would have been incorrect.
  - In examples 2 and 3, there is a “. . .” in the middle of the quotation. It appears that the writer chose not to include some of the text that was in the original and used the “. . .” to show that some of the text is missing. The writer may have chosen to do this, because the text that was left out was not as important to the argument.
  - In example 3, the word “which” is added in brackets after a “. . .” shows that some of the original text is not included. The word “which” is not in the original text. The writer may have included the word “which,” because it clarifies the meaning of the sentence.

Differentiation Consideration: If necessary, explain to students that the three periods together is called an ellipsis (plural: ellipses) and is used to show where text has been removed from a quotation.

- Students write the definition of ellipsis in the appropriate section of their vocabulary journals.

Explain to students that writers may make small changes to a quotation so that the quotation’s inclusion makes sense grammatically and contextually. Students may also need to replace a pronoun in a quotation if it is unclear to whom or what the pronoun refers. Explain to students that in some cases, the whole quotation is too long or only some parts of it are relevant for their argument, so they may want to exclude unnecessary phrases in the middle of the quotation. While small changes are acceptable, explain to students that in order to increase the readability of their writing they should try to integrate quotations in a way that avoids a lot of modifications. Too many modifications can be distracting and detract from the power of the writer’s argument. Inform students that if they must replace or clarify a pronoun in a quotation, modify a verb, or shorten the quotation, they should use the following marks to show that they edited the quotation. Remind students that when making these edits, it is necessary to preserve the quotation’s original meaning:

- Brackets to replace or clarify pronouns, align capitalization, replace indirect references with specific references, or to modify verbs.
- Ellipses to replace unnecessary text, such as phrases and clauses that do not impact meaning in the quotation.
Tips for Punctuating Quotations Handout

There are several ways to include quotations in a sentence, and the punctuation rules differ depending on the context:

**Introduce the quote with a colon.**
- Use a colon to introduce the quote when both the quote and the clause preceding it are independent clauses (i.e., complete sentences).
  - **Example:** Technology can have positive effects on people: “Wiring up our brains like this makes us adept at filtering information, making snap decisions, and fielding the incoming digital debris” (Perez).

**Introduce the quote with a comma.**
- Write a phrase followed by a comma to introduce the quote when the phrase would require a comma at the end even if no quote were integrated (e.g., the phrase begins with a preposition).
  - **Example:** With people using technology too often, “sustained concentration, reading body language, and making offline friends are skills that are fading away” (Perez).
- Write a phrase followed by a comma to introduce a quote when the phrase indicates that the quote is something an author wrote or a person said:
  - **Example:** Writer Sarah Perez argues, “Wiring up our brains like this makes us adept at filtering information, making snap decisions, and fielding the incoming digital debris.”

**Introduce the quote with a phrase ending in that.**
- Use the word *that* to introduce a quote when the word *that* contributes to the clarity and accuracy of the entire sentence. Do not use a comma after the word *that*.
  - **Example:** Experts state that “[w]iring up our brains like this makes us adept at filtering information, making snap decisions, and fielding the incoming digital debris” (Perez).

**Insert short quotations into your own sentence.**
- Use quoted words or short phrases within your own complete sentence. Use the punctuation that would be required even if no quote were integrated.
  - **Example:** Because of the overuse of technology, “sustained concentration” is an ability that is “fading away” (Perez).
Notes on Punctuating After Quotes

- When the sentence includes a parenthetical citation, place the proper punctuation for the sentence—a period, question mark, exclamation point, comma, colon, or semicolon—after the citation, not inside the quotation marks. Even if the quote is a complete sentence or uses the end of a sentence, do not include the period from the original source inside of the quotation marks.
  
  o **Example:** Technology can have positive effects on people: “Wiring up our brains like this makes us adept at filtering information, making snap decisions, and fielding the incoming digital debris” (Perez).

- When the sentence includes a parenthetical citation, only include a question mark or exclamation point inside of the quotation mark when those punctuation marks are included in the original source.
  
  o **Example:** Weighing the positive and negative effects of technology use, she poses a question: “Are we driving distracted or have our brains adapted to the incoming stimuli?” (Perez).

- When the sentence does not include a parenthetical citation, periods and commas that are appropriate for the sentence go inside the quotation mark. However, if a quotation mark, exclamation point, colon, or semicolon is appropriate for the sentence but not in the original source, these punctuation marks go outside of the quotation mark.
  
  o **Example:** Writer Sarah Perez argues, “Wiring up our brains like this makes us adept at filtering information, making snap decisions, and fielding the incoming digital debris.”
  
  o **Example:** Writer Sarah Perez argues, “Wiring up our brains like this makes us adept at filtering information”; however, the effects of technology use are not all positive.

- A punctuation mark after a quotation—whether or not a parenthetical citation is included—is not always necessary. Sometimes, no punctuation mark is the proper choice. One strategy for determining if punctuation is necessary is to consider whether the punctuation mark is correct had the phrase not been a quotation.
  
  o **Example:** “[S]ustained concentration” is an ability that is “fading away” (Perez).
Appendix 4: In-Text Citations

Remind students that, although they are the authors of their own papers, they are drawing on other authors’ writing in order to develop their arguments. Inform students that failing to give other authors credit when referencing their work is called plagiarism. Explain that plagiarism is taking someone else’s work or ideas and passing it off as one’s own.

- Students write the definition of plagiarism in the appropriate section of their vocabulary journals.

Consider asking students to share examples of plagiarism.

Explain to students that someone can plagiarize by copying the exact words from a source without citing the source, even if they use quotation marks. Plagiarism also occurs when a writer uses different words to express the same idea as another author (e.g., if someone takes the claim and evidence from another paper and writes it with different words, it is still plagiarism if the original source is not cited). Remind students that even though they might have similar opinions or views as the author of one of their sources, they must create an original argument based on all the evidence available to them and cite sources wherever possible.

Consider reminding students that the goal of their writing in this unit is for students to construct their own argument and support it with the information from supplementary texts like “Social Media as Community,” not for students to repeat the arguments of these texts verbatim.

Inform students that plagiarism is an ethical offense and often results in serious consequences. In addition to disciplinary consequences, plagiarism is counterproductive to the learning process, as stealing someone else’s ideas will not build the deep understanding that results from learning on one’s own.

Inform students they can avoid plagiarism by always citing works properly. Proper citation gives credit to the author one is quoting, paraphrasing, or referencing.

Provide students with the following definition: citation means “quoting or referencing a book, paper, or author.”

- Students write the definition of citation in the appropriate section of their vocabulary journals.

Explain to students that they will use a specific format for citing sources, called MLA citation. Distribute the MLA In-Text Citation Handout. Instruct students to examine the handout and Think, Pair, Share about the following questions:

Describe how the writer cites each example, including any punctuation used. What rules for MLA in-text citation can be inferred from these examples?

- Student responses should include:
○ In Example 1, the writer includes a parenthetical citation at the end of the sentence that includes the author’s last name and the page number. There is no punctuation mark between the author’s last name and the page number. This example shows that if the information is available, the writer should cite the author’s last name and the page number.

○ In Example 2, the writer includes a parenthetical citation at the end of the sentence with only the page number but no author’s last name; however, the writer uses the author’s last name earlier in the same sentence. This example shows that if the writer refers to the author by name in the same sentence, then the parenthetical citation only needs the page number.

○ In Example 3, the writer includes a parenthetical citation at the end of the sentence that includes the author’s last name and no page number. This example shows that if no page number is available, the writer should cite the author’s last name.

○ In Example 4, the writer does not include a parenthetical citation at the end of the sentence; however, the writer uses the author’s last name earlier in the same sentence. This example indicates that if the writer refers to the author by name in the same sentence and no page number is available, then no parenthetical citation is needed.

○ In Example 5, the writer includes the title of the article and the page number in the parentheses. This example shows that if there is no author, the writer must include the first few words of the title of the article and page number in the parentheses.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of in-text citations, ensuring that students understand the rules for proper citations and punctuation.
# MLA In-Text Citation Handout

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name:</th>
<th>Class:</th>
<th>Date:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

## In-Text Citations

For in-text citations for an online source, use the following examples as a guide:

- **Example 1** (page numbers provided): Likewise, according to a communications professor at Stanford, “the ultimate risk of heavy technology use is that it diminishes empathy by limiting how much people engage with one another, even in the same room” (Richtel 9).

- **Example 2** (page numbers provided): Likewise, journalist Matt Richtel reports that “the ultimate risk of heavy technology use is that it diminishes empathy by limiting how much people engage with one another, even in the same room” (9).

- **Example 3** (no page numbers): Likewise, according to a communications professor at Stanford, “the ultimate risk of heavy technology use is that it diminishes empathy by limiting how much people engage with one another, even in the same room” (Richtel).

- **Example 4** (no page numbers): Likewise, journalist Matt Richtel reports that “the ultimate risk of heavy technology use is that it diminishes empathy by limiting how much people engage with one another, even in the same room.”

- **Example 5** (no author): Likewise, the article explains that “the ultimate risk of heavy technology use is that it diminishes empathy by limiting how much people engage with one another, even in the same room” (“Attached to Technology” 9).
Trends: Integrating Evidence from a Source
Audience, Style and Tone

Directions:
1. Read through the appendix lessons
2. For each trend, identify one activity to support this student writing in Essay 7.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Direct Instruction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Supplemental Skills Instruction

WR.1.B Argument

Lessons WR.1.A–G offer direct instruction on discrete skills and should be implemented between Lessons 10 and 11. Students may benefit from some or all of the instruction in these lessons; only those lessons or activities that address student needs should be implemented.

Introduction

This lesson is composed of two distinct but related activities that center on skills for producing writing that is appropriate for the particular audience. Each activity may last an entire class period.

Writing Instruction Options:

- Addressing an Audience’s Knowledge Level and Concerns
- Formal Style and Objective Tone

In this lesson, the teacher provides direct instruction to students on how to address an audience’s knowledge level and concerns in an argument. Students also learn how to identify and use formal style and objective tone. Students focus on revising their own argument drafts to ensure that they have appropriately addressed the audience’s knowledge level and concerns or used formal style and objective tone before transitioning to a peer discussion of revisions. Student learning is assessed via the completion of the WR.1 Revision Exit Slip: Audience, Style, and Tone, on which each student records one example of a successful revision.

For homework, students choose three different passages from their arguments and revise each passage focusing on addressing the audience’s knowledge level and concerns or using formal style and objective tone. Students also write a few sentences explaining whether or not they will keep the revisions they drafted and the impact this decision has on their arguments.

Standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assessed Standard(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W.9-10.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Addressed Standard(s)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard(s)</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W.9-10.5</td>
<td>Develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, rewriting, or trying a new approach, focusing on addressing what is most significant for a specific purpose and audience.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| W.9-10.1.b, d | Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.  
   b. Develop claim(s) and counterclaims fairly, supplying evidence for each while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both in a manner that anticipates the audience's knowledge level and concerns.  
   d. Establish and maintain a formal style and objective tone while attending to the norms and conventions of the discipline in which they are writing. |
| W.9-10.6    | Use technology, including the Internet, to produce, publish, and update individual or shared writing products, taking advantage of technology’s capacity to link to other information and to display information flexibly and dynamically. |
| SL.9-10.1   | Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively. |

### Assessment

**Assessment(s)**

Student learning is assessed via completion of the WR.1 Revision Exit Slip: Audience, Style, and Tone. Students record the original passage from their arguments as well as the revised passage. Students then explain why the revision is effective.

1. Consider assessing these revisions using the Argument Writing Checklist.

**High Performance Response(s)**

A High Performance Response should:

- Record the original passage (e.g., Likewise, according to a communications professor at Stanford, “the ultimate risk of heavy technology use is that it diminishes empathy by limiting how much people engage with one another, even in the same room” (Richtel)).

- Revise the original passage, focusing on addressing the audience’s knowledge level and concerns or using formal style and objective tone (e.g., Likewise, according to a communications professor at Stanford, “the ultimate risk of heavy technology use is that it diminishes empathy by limiting how much people engage with one another, even in the same room” (Richtel)). In other words,
people lose the ability to positively and effectively interact with one another and form relationships.

- Explain why the revision is effective (e.g., After the quotation, I included an explanatory sentence to ensure that the principal understands the evidence.).

① See the Model WR.1 Revision Exit Slip: Audience, Style, and Tone for more examples.

Lesson Agenda/Overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student-Facing Agenda</th>
<th>% of Lesson</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Standards:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Standards: W.9-10.4, W.9-10.5, W.9-10.1.b, d, W.9-10.6, SL.9-10.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Learning Sequence:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction of Lesson Agenda</td>
<td>1. 5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Homework Accountability</td>
<td>2. 0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Writing Instruction Options:</td>
<td>3. 30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Addressing an Audience’s Knowledge Level and Concerns</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Formal Style and Objective Tone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Argument Writing Checklist</td>
<td>4. 5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Individual Revision</td>
<td>5. 30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Revision Discussion</td>
<td>6. 20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. WR.1 Revision Exit Slip: Audience, Style, and Tone</td>
<td>7. 5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Closing</td>
<td>8. 5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Materials

- Student copies of the up-to-date Argument Writing Checklist (refer to WR.1 Lesson A Model Argument Writing Checklist)
- Copies of the WR.1 Revision Exit Slip: __________ for each student (refer to WR.1 Lesson A)—students will need additional blank copies
## Learning Sequence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Symbol</th>
<th>Type of Text &amp; Interpretation of the Symbol</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
<td>Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>no symbol</td>
<td>Plain text indicates teacher action.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bold text</td>
<td>Indicated questions for the teacher to ask students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>italicized text</em></td>
<td>Indicates a vocabulary word.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▶️</td>
<td>Indicates student action(s).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>📨</td>
<td>Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>📐</td>
<td>Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda 5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda. In this lesson, students learn how to take their audience’s knowledge level and concerns into account or how to identify and use formal style and objective tone when writing an academic argument. Students revise their own drafts before participating in a peer discussion of their individual revisions.

- Students look at the agenda.

### Activity 2: Homework Accountability 0%

Students will be held accountable for homework during Activity 6: Revision Discussion.

### Activity 3: Writing Instruction Options 30%

- Based on student need, select from the two options below:
  - Addressing an Audience’s Knowledge Level and Concerns (See Appendix 1)
  - Formal Style and Objective Tone (See Appendix 2)

### Activity 4: Argument Writing Checklist 5%

- The following activity addresses the expectations of SL.9-10.1.

Instruct students to take out their copies of the Argument Writing Checklist.

- Consider posting or projecting the Argument Writing Checklist.
Instruct students to Think, Pair, Share about the following questions:

**Based on this lesson’s writing instruction, what items should the class add to the Argument Writing Checklist? In which categories do these items belong and why?**

- Student responses will vary but should include points that address the following:
  - Anticipate and address the audience’s knowledge level and concerns? This item belongs in the Command of Evidence and Reasoning category, because this item is about thinking about the audience’s knowledge level and concerns to use the most meaningful and compelling evidence for the specific audience in order to support claims and develop reasoning.
  - Establish and maintain a formal style and objective tone? This item belongs in the Coherence, Organization, and Style category, because formal style and objective tone are about how the writer expresses the content of the argument.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses. Guide students to a consensus on what items the class will add to the Argument Writing Checklist and in which category each item belongs. Instruct students to add the new items in the appropriate categories to their copies of the Argument Writing Checklist.

- Students add new items in the appropriate categories to their copies of the Argument Writing Checklist.

① Consider adding the new items in the appropriate categories to the displayed copy of the Argument Writing Checklist.

### Activity 5: Individual Revision 30%

① The following activity addresses the expectations of W.9-10.1.b, d.

Instruct students to independently revise their drafts focusing on whichever of the following writing skills they learned in this lesson:

- Addressing an Audience’s Knowledge Level and Concerns
- Formal Style and Objective Tone

① For example, if students completed the writing instruction activity on Addressing an Audience’s Knowledge Level and Concerns, their revisions should focus on addressing an audience’s knowledge level and concerns rather than formal style and objective tone.
Explain to students that they should revise at least three passages to ensure that they have appropriately addressed the audience’s knowledge level and concerns or used formal style and objective tone. Remind students to refer to the Argument Writing Checklist as they revise their drafts.

Transition to individual revision.

- Students independently revise their drafts to ensure that they address their audience’s knowledge level and concerns or that they use formal style and objective tone throughout their arguments.

For sample revisions, see the Model WR.1 Revision Exit Slip: Audience, Style, and Tone.

**Activity 6: Revision Discussion 20%**

1. The following activity addresses the expectations of SL.9-10.1.

Instruct students to form pairs or small groups to share at least one of the passages they revised during the previous activity and one passage they revised during the previous lesson’s homework assignment. Explain to students that in addition to receiving feedback on their revisions, this discussion is also an opportunity to consider how they can use similar revisions or try similar techniques as their peers in their own papers. In this discussion, students provide brief constructive criticism to their peers. Remind students that constructive criticism helps them share advice with their peers in a positive and academic manner.

1. Refer to Lesson 8 for a discussion of constructive criticism.

Instruct students to follow these steps to complete the revision discussion:

1. Show your peers the original passage and the revised passage.
2. Explain to your peers how the revision improves your draft.
3. Ask your peers to provide brief constructive criticism on your revisions.

- Students share and discuss with peers at least two effective revisions they made to their drafts.

1. In lessons that include the Revision Discussion, consider maintaining the same peer pairs or small groups for several lessons, so that students can benefit from a reviewer who is familiar with their drafts.

**Activity 7: WR.1 Revision Exit Slip: Audience, Style, and Tone 5%**

Explain that for this lesson’s assessment, students record and explain one example of a successful revision. Distribute blank copies of the WR.1 Revision Exit Slip: _______ to each student. Instruct students to fill in the title “Audience, Style, and Tone” on their exit slips. Instruct students to complete
the exit slip independently. Inform students that their revisions will be assessed with the Argument Writing Checklist.

- See the High Performance Response and Model WR.1 Revision Exit Slip: Audience, Style, and Tone for sample student responses.

**Activity 8: Closing**

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to choose three different passages from their drafts. For each passage, students revise their drafts focusing on whichever of the following writing skills they learned in this lesson:

- Addressing an Audience’s Knowledge Level and Concerns
- Formal Style and Objective Tone

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following questions for each revision:

**Will you keep the revision you drafted? Why or why not?**

**Explain the impact of your decision on your argument.**

If an online writing community has been established for the class, instruct students to post their revised drafts for sharing with peers and/or assessment. (Students’ use of the online writing community addresses the expectations of W.9-10.6).

- Students follow along.

**Homework**

Choose three different passages from your draft. For each passage, revise your draft focusing on whichever of the following writing skills you learned in this lesson:

- Addressing an Audience’s Knowledge Level and Concerns
- Formal Style and Objective Tone

Write a few sentences responding to the following questions for each revision:

**Will you keep the revision you drafted? Why or why not?**

**Explain the impact of your decision on your argument.**
# Model Argument Writing Checklist

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name:</th>
<th>Class:</th>
<th>Date:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Directions:** Use this template to record the checklist items that convey the components of an effective argument established as a class.

### Command of Evidence and Reasoning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Does my response...</th>
<th>Drafting</th>
<th>Finalization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Use relevant and sufficient evidence to support my claims?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use valid reasoning to demonstrate clear relationships between claims and evidence?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop counterclaims fairly?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrate evidence (quotations and paraphrasing) to support claims and counterclaims?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anticipate and address the audience’s knowledge level and concerns?*</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Coherence, Organization, and Style

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Does my response...</th>
<th>Drafting</th>
<th>Finalization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduce a precise central claim?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop supporting claims that reinforce or advance the central claim?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adapt content and language to my specific audience?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adapt style of writing to convince my audience of my central claim?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arrange claims, counterclaims, evidence, and reasoning to create clear relationships among all the components of the argument?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have an introduction that captures the readers’ attention and interest?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have an introduction that establishes the topic and central claim of my argument?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide a conclusion that follows from and supports the argument?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Control of Conventions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Does my response...</th>
<th>Drafting</th>
<th>Finalization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cite sources using proper MLA style and formatting?</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use proper punctuation for quotations and citations?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Asterisks indicate new items added in this lesson.
# Model WR.1 Revision Exit Slip: Audience, Style, and Tone

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name:</th>
<th>Class:</th>
<th>Date:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Directions:** In the first column, record the original passage from your argument. In the second column, record the revised passage. In the third column, explain why the revision is effective.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original Passage</th>
<th>Revised Passage</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Distracted by the constant need to check their e-mail or texts ... it’s painfully obvious that today’s teenagers cannot live without their screens.</td>
<td>Distracted by the constant need to check their e-mail or texts ... it is painfully obvious that today’s teenagers cannot live without their screens.</td>
<td>I replaced the contraction to make my writing more formal.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Likewise, according to a communications professor at Stanford, “the ultimate risk of heavy technology use is that it diminishes empathy by limiting how much people engage with one another, even in the same room” (Richtel). | Likewise, according to a communications professor at Stanford, “the ultimate risk of heavy technology use is that it diminishes empathy by limiting how much people engage with one another, even in the same room” (Richtel). In other words, people lose the ability to positively and effectively interact with one another and form relationships. | After the quotation, I included an explanatory sentence to ensure that the principal understands the evidence. |

In order to preserve the health of your students’ young minds and social lives, [name of school here] should participate in “Shut Down Your Screen Week.” | In order to preserve the health of students’ young minds and social lives, [name of school here] should participate in “Shut Down Your Screen Week.” | I removed the second person “your” to make my writing less personal and more objective. |
Addressing an Audience’s Knowledge Level and Concerns

Appendix 1: Addressing an Audience’s Knowledge Level and Concerns

Remind students that in Lesson 2, they learned that effective writers always take their audience’s knowledge levels and concerns into account when they construct arguments. Review the importance of this skill by instructing students to Think, Pair, Share about the following question:

Why is it important to consider the specific audience when writing an argument?

- Student responses may include:
  - Writers should consider the audience so that they provide the right information and the right level of detail about a topic based on what the audience may or may not already know.
  - Writers should consider their audience so that they can adapt their writing to acknowledge and address an audience's beliefs about a topic, include the information that is most important to an audience, and address what the audience cares about in the argument.

① Differentiation Consideration: If students struggle to provide reasons why it is important to consider the specific audience when writing an argument, consider conducting a brief role-playing exercise. Instruct students to form pairs and present them with the following scenario:

A teenager wants to go to an event this weekend (e.g., a movie, concert, game, show, etc.). The teenager wants to convince a friend to attend the event with her or him. The teenager also needs to convince her or his parent to allow her or him to attend the event.

Instruct student pairs to take turns acting as the teenager and audience. Inform students that when they are acting as the teenager, they should think about what is important to their particular audience (i.e., either the friend or the parent). When students are acting as the friend or parent, encourage them to ask the teenager for information that they think the friend or parent might care to know. Consider asking volunteer student pairs to perform their role-play in front of the class.

- Student pairs role-play the scenario, taking turns acting as the teenager, friend, and parent.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses. Then remind students that different audiences have different knowledge levels about particular topics and different concerns about how topics are treated. Explain to students that anticipating their audience’s knowledge level and concerns can help students develop their arguments appropriately and can also help them imagine and prepare for counterclaims. Inform students that they will apply these considerations in revising their arguments.

Instruct students to Turn-and-Talk in pairs to discuss the following questions:
What do you think the principal’s knowledge level of your argument topic is? Are there any terms or concepts in your draft that you should explain?

- Student responses will vary depending on the principal but may include:
  - The principal seems well informed about digital media, so I do not need to explain different examples like Facebook, Twitter, and texting.
  - I quote the term “dopamine” in my draft, and the principal might not know what dopamine does, since it is a scientific term. I need to explain how dopamine relates to addiction to digital media.
  - I quote the term “neural pathways,” and because it is a scientific term, the principal may not understand what I mean. I need to explain what it means for the brain to form neural pathways and why that can be beneficial.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses. Explain to students that anticipating an audience’s knowledge level (background knowledge related to the argument topic) allows the writer to include the appropriate level of information to contextualize any claims, evidence, or reasoning. The writer can also address an audience’s knowledge level by including definitions or explanations of any terms or concepts essential for understanding the argument.

- Students write the definition of knowledge level in the appropriate section of their vocabulary journals.

Instruct students to take out their drafts and identify a passage in which they anticipated and addressed the principal’s concerns.

1. Differentiation Consideration: If necessary, explain that concerns are matters that engage a person’s interest or care, or that affect a person’s welfare or happiness.

- Students write the definition of concerns in the appropriate section of their vocabulary journals.

Instruct students to Turn-and-Talk to share their passages and discuss how they anticipated and addressed the principal’s concerns.

- Student responses may include:
  - Because the principal works around kids all day and talks to teachers about students’ performance, I anticipated that the principal might be concerned with how digital media affects concentration. To address this concern, I included evidence from research and scientists that “[h]eavy multitaskers actually have more trouble focusing and shutting out irrelevant information ... and they experience more stress” (Richtel) and that “sustained concentration” is a skill that is “fading away” (Perez).
  - Because the principal encourages the use of technology in the classroom, I anticipated that the principal might be concerned with whether or not there are any benefits to digital media. To address that concern, I included evidence about how using the Internet helps “make[] us adept at filtering information, making snap decisions, and fielding the incoming digital debris” (Perez).

1. If students cannot find a passage in which they anticipate and address the principal’s concerns, encourage students to discuss how they might accomplish this during revision.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses. Explain to students that anticipating their audience’s concerns can help students choose the most meaningful and compelling evidence to reinforce their claims.
Formal Style and Objective Tone

Appendix 2: Formal Style and Objective Tone

Explain to students that it is important to maintain a formal style in academic writing. Inform students that a formal style is used for writing academic papers in college and is often expected or required in the workplace.

Post or project the following examples for students:

1. Example 2 is taken from paragraph 3 of the Model Argument (refer to Lesson 10). Example 1 has been modified from the model.

   • Example 1: However, it’s not just how totally addictive things like Facebook and Instagram are; using these things so much can’t be good for the brain.

   • Example 2: However, it is not simply the addictive quality of digital media that is concerning; this kind of extensive use is actually harmful to the brain.

Instruct students to Turn-and-Talk to discuss the following questions:

Which example is formal and which is informal? Which example is more appropriate for an academic argument? Why?

✍️ Student responses should include:

   - The first example is informal and the second is formal. The first example uses conversational words like “totally” and contractions like “it’s” and “can’t.” The first example also uses imprecise words and phrases like “things,” “these things,” “so much,” and “good.” These words sound more casual, like someone is talking to a friend. Using informal words is appropriate for a conversation with a friend.

   - The second example uses more formal and academic words and phrases like “it is not simply” and “the addictive quality.” The second example also uses more precise words and phrases: instead of “things,” “so much,” and “can’t be good,” the second example uses “digital media,” “extensive,” and “harmful.” The second example does not use contractions. These differences give the second example a more authoritative and academically credible tone. Using academic words and phrases is appropriate for a formal argument.

1. If necessary, remind students that they learned the definitions for style, formal, and informal in Lesson 1.

1. Consider informing students that they will learn about choosing precise words to improve the strength of their arguments in Lesson C.

How might using a formal style help a writer make an effective argument?
Student responses may include:

- Using a formal style helps a writer make an effective argument, because a formal style makes the writer seem like a believable authority on the topic.
- Using a formal style helps a writer make an effective argument, because a formal style makes the argument seem professional and encourages the reader to take the writer’s claims seriously.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses. Explain to students that a formal style establishes credibility and makes the writing professional, appealing, and accessible to the audience. A formal style uses correct and specific language, correct grammar, and complete sentences. Remind students to avoid the use of contractions (e.g., don’t), abbreviations (e.g., gov’t), or slang (e.g., ain’t), unless they are directly quoting from a text that uses such words.

Explain to students that along with using a formal style in their paper, it is equally important to use an objective tone. Explain that writing with an objective tone is “a style of writing that is based on fact and makes use of the third-person point of view.”

- Students write the definition and attributes of objective tone in the appropriate section of their vocabulary journals.

Consider reminding students that in some cases, powerful and persuasive arguments can be personal, using subjective, rather than objective, anecdotes and examples to support claims. Ensure that students understand that in the writing assignment for this unit, their arguments express their own opinions, but they are using facts to take an informed and objective position on the topic and develop their claims, evidence, and reasoning.

Post or project the following examples for students:

- Example 1 is taken from paragraph 3 of the Model Argument (refer to Lesson 10). Example 2 has been modified from the model.

- Example 1: However, it is not simply the addictive quality of digital media that is concerning; this kind of extensive use is actually harmful to the brain.

- Example 2: However, I don’t think it’s just the addictive quality of digital media that should concern you; I believe this kind of extensive use is really harming our brains.

Instruct students to Turn-and-Talk about the following questions:

Which example uses an objective tone and which does not?

- Student responses should include:
The first example uses an objective tone because it does not have “I,” “you,” or “our” in the sentence. The first example reflects the writer’s opinion by making a claim, but the claim is straightforward and in the third-person.

The second example uses words and phrases like “I think,” “should concern you,” and “our brains,” which makes it personal and less objective. The sentence sounds like someone is trying to convince a peer of his or her point of view in conversation. The second example’s use of the second person “you” makes it sound even more conversational and less academic than the first sentence.

Consider explaining to students that the use of first- and second-person point of view (i.e., I, we, our, you, and your) is not prohibited in all argument writing, but its usage is not appropriate in all contexts. In more formal, academic writing, writers typically use third person, though journalists, bloggers, politicians, and other writers may use first and second person as a rhetorical strategy. Students should carefully consider their task, purpose, and audience to determine whether the use of first- and second-person point of view is appropriate.

How might using an objective tone help a writer make an effective argument?

- Student responses may include:
  - Using an objective tone helps a writer make an effective argument, because an objective tone helps the writer seem neutral by focusing on presenting real evidence rather than making statements about what he or she believes without any evidence.
  - Using an objective tone helps a writer make an effective argument, because it makes the argument seem more professional and less conversational.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses. Explain to students that as with using a formal style, using an objective tone helps the writer establish credibility. Writing with an objective tone helps writers convey respect for their audience and avoid expressing their unverified personal opinions by focusing on presenting the evidence and reasoning they gathered to support their claims. Because students are using evidence from other sources to defend their claims, writing with an objective tone for this assignment also means using the third-person point of view (i.e., he, she, it, they, one) instead of the first person point of view (i.e., I, we) or the second person point of view (i.e., you). Using an objective tone with the third person point of view keeps the argument academic and helps writers avoid making the argument personal or conversational.
SUPPLEMENTAL SKILLS INSTRUCTION

WR.1.D ARGUMENT Cohesion and Flow

Lessons WR.1.A–G offer direct instruction on discrete skills and should be implemented between Lessons 10 and 11. Students may benefit from some or all of the instruction in these lessons; only those lessons or activities that address student needs should be implemented.

Introduction

This lesson is composed of two distinct but related activities that center on skills for creating cohesion and flow to improve argument writing. Each activity may last an entire class period.

Writing Instruction Options:

• Varied Syntax
• Transitional Words and Phrases

In this lesson, the teacher provides direct instruction to students on identifying and using varied syntax and transitional words and phrases. Students focus on revising their own arguments for varied syntax or transitional words and phrases before transitioning to a peer discussion of revisions. Student learning is assessed via the completion of the WR.1 Revision Exit Slip: Cohesion and Flow, on which each student records one example of successful revision.
Appendix 1: Varied Syntax

Explain to students that **syntax** refers to the arrangement of words and phrases to create well formed sentences. Syntax also relates to the impact that this arrangement has on a reader’s understanding of an author’s purpose or point of view.

1. Consider asking students to volunteer the definition of syntax before providing it to the class.
   - Students write the definition of syntax in the appropriate section of their vocabulary journals.

Post or project the following examples.

1. Example 1 is taken from paragraph 3 of the Model Argument (refer to Lesson 10). Example 2 has been modified from the model.
   - **Example 1:** Using technology frequently throughout the day often requires people to multitask, and excessive multitasking is dangerous for the brain.
   - **Example 2:** Excessive multitasking is dangerous for the brain, and using technology frequently throughout the day often requires people to multitask.

Instruct students to Turn-and-Talk about the following questions:

**Compare how the words and phrases are arranged in each example.**

- In the first example, the sentence begins with technology use and then how often and when people use it. Then, the sentence brings up multitasking and its effects on the brain. However, in the second example, the sentence begins with multitasking’s danger for the brain and then brings up technology use and its link to multitasking.

**What is the effect of word order on the emphasis and meaning in each sentence?**

- Student responses may include:
  - By beginning the first example sentence with the phrases about technology use and its frequency before bringing up multitasking, the writer clarifies that it is the frequency of technology use that leads to multitasking. By ending the sentence with the effects of “excessive multitasking” on the brain, the writer emphasizes the claim that frequent technology use “dangerous for the brain.”
  - By beginning the second example sentence with the phrases about too much multitasking being harmful to the brain, the writer first emphasizes the danger of multitasking before bringing up the claim that frequent technology use leads to multitasking.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses. Then explain to students that sentences with simple syntax are short (with few phrases). Sentences with complex syntax may be longer (with many
phrases). Changes in word order or sentence length and complexity are called variations in syntax. Explain to students that writers vary syntax to emphasize certain ideas and/or create a stylistic effect. For example, a writer can vary syntax to quicken the pace with short sentences or lengthen the pace with longer sentences.

- Students write the definition of variations in syntax in the appropriate section of their vocabulary journals.

Post or project the following examples.

1. Example 1 is taken from paragraph 5 of the Model Argument (refer to Lesson 10). Example 2 has been modified from the model.

- **Example 1:** Nevertheless, constant use of technology has its disadvantages. Screens limit face-to-face communication. Overusing digital media can inhibit social development by preventing people from making and developing meaningful connections with each other. Attachment to a screen or e-mail inbox becomes a replacement for engaging with other human beings. This social separation is especially damaging for children. According to Dr. Angela Diaz, the Internet is not a valid substitute for social interaction. She argues, “It’s important for kids to be connected to people” and “not just isolated in their own rooms” (Norton). Likewise, according to a communications professor at Stanford, “the ultimate risk of heavy technology use is that it diminishes empathy by limiting how much people engage with one another, even in the same room” (Richtel). In other words, people lose the ability to positively and effectively interact with one another and form relationships.

- **Example 2:** Technology can have disadvantages. Screens limit face-to-face communication. Digital media can inhibit social development. Digital media can prevent people from making and developing relationships. People replace each other with screens and e-mail inboxes. Social separation is bad for children. Dr. Angela Diaz says that the Internet cannot substitute social interaction. She says, “It’s important for kids to be connected to people” and “not just isolated in their own rooms” (Norton). According to a Stanford professor, “the ultimate risk of heavy technology use is that it diminishes empathy by limiting how much people engage with one another, even in the same room” (Richtel). People are unable to interact and form relationships.

Instruct students to read the examples and Turn-and-Talk about the following questions.

**How does the writer vary syntax in these paragraphs?**

- Student responses may include:
  - In the first example, the writer varies syntax by combining sentences with transitional words like “nevertheless,” “by,” “this,” and “likewise.”
  - In the first example, the writer also varies syntax by using both long, complex sentences and short, simple sentences in which the order of words in each sentence is different.
The second example uses mostly short, simple sentences. Also, the writer repeats the same syntax in each sentence as the words and phrases are ordered in the same way, so the syntax is not varied.

1 Differentiation Consideration: If students struggle, consider using a masterful reading of this example set. This practice supports students’ understanding of varied syntax by allowing them to hear the effect of structure on the rhythm of the sentence.

What is the effect of the varied syntax on meaning, style, and emphasis in these examples?

rlen: Student responses may include:

1. In the first example, the varied syntax makes the connections between ideas clear, which contributes to the overall cohesiveness of the paragraph. The variations in syntax make the paragraph easier to read, because the sentences are not choppy, which adds to the power of the argument.

2. The repetitive syntax in the second example makes the paragraph sound choppy with incomplete and vague ideas. The lack of varied syntax in the second example makes the paragraph more difficult to read, and the connections between ideas are less clear. The lack of variation also makes the paragraph less engaging to read, which takes away from the power of an argument.

1 Differentiation Consideration: If students struggle to answer these questions, consider providing more examples from the model argument (complete model in Lesson 10) or other student essays to assist in their understanding of how variations in syntax can affect the meaning, emphasis, and style of a piece of writing.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses. Explain to students that varied syntax can give significant strength to their arguments. Varying the length and structure of sentences can help readers engage with the text and strengthen the power, pacing, and flow of the argument.
Appendix 2: Transitional Words and Phrases

Introduce students to the ideas of cohesion and transitions. Explain to students that cohesion in writing refers to how well the paragraphs and sentences link the claims and evidence of a text together into a coherent whole. Explain to students that transitions are words and phrases that are used to create cohesion.

- Students write the definitions of cohesion and transitions in the appropriate section of their vocabulary journals.

Explain to students that achieving cohesion and successfully using transitions are important aspects of careful revision. Explain to students that cohesion should exist between paragraphs as well as between sentences. In both cases, transitional words and phrases can help link ideas and support the logic of the paper.

Distribute the Transitions Handout. Explain that the handout provides a variety of transitional words to use in specific cases. Explain to students that the words are grouped together by the way they are used. For example, words like furthermore and besides are used for addition, which means they can be used to continue a line of reasoning or sustain a thought between sentences or paragraphs. Phrases like in the same way or the word likewise can be used to show that ideas are similar.

- Students listen and examine the handout.

Instruct students to form pairs or small groups. Post or project the following two paragraphs and instruct student pairs or groups to identify and record words and phrases that support transition and cohesion between sentences and paragraphs.

1. Example 1 is taken from paragraph 3 of the Model Argument (refer to Lesson 10). Example 2 is modified from paragraph 4 of the Model Argument (refer to Lesson 10).

- Example 1: However, it is not simply the addictive quality of digital media that is concerning; this kind of extensive use is actually harmful to the brain. Using technology frequently throughout the day often requires people to multitask, and excessive multitasking is dangerous for the brain. Research has shown that “[h]eavy multitaskers actually have more trouble focusing and shutting out irrelevant information ... and they experience more stress” (Richtel). These effects continue even when people stop multitasking, effectively changing the way the brain works, according to brain scientist Nora Volkow (Richtel). In the article “Education 2.0 Never Memorize Again?” writer Sarah Perez states that because of the overuse of technology, “sustained concentration” is a skill that is “fading away.” Ultimately, the long-term effect of excessive multitasking is the inability to give full concentration to whatever information is at hand, which inhibits intellectual development.

- Example 2: Some research indicates that using technology can benefit a person's brain. Perez reports that “our exposure to the net is impacting the way our brains form neural pathways ... [which] makes us adept at filtering information, making snap decisions, and fielding the incoming
digital debris." People’s brains are growing in new ways from using screens. One study showed that playing fast-paced video games can improve a person’s reaction time and ability to see details, which are skills that can be applied in the real-world, like when driving (Richtel).

Instruct students to answer the following questions in their pairs or groups before sharing out with the class. Instruct students to use the Transitions Handout as a reference.

**Which of these paragraphs is more cohesive and why?**

- The first paragraph is more cohesive. The paragraph relies on transitional words and phrases, like “however,” “ultimately,” and “these effects” to connect and relate the evidence and reasoning to the claim and move from one idea to another.

**Which of these paragraphs is less cohesive and why?**

- The second paragraph contains valuable information, but it lacks transitional words and phrases to help link ideas or qualify relationships. There is no connection in the first sentence or last sentence of this paragraph to indicate how it is linked to the paragraph before it or after it. There are also no transitions between sentences.

### Differentiation Consideration:

If students struggle to identify differences between the paragraphs, consider preparing a highlighted version of the paragraphs, annotating the transitional words and phrases in the first example and the lack of transitional words and phrases in the second example.

### Differentiation Consideration:

If students need additional practice using transitional words and phrases, instruct students to work in pairs or small groups to add transitions to the second example paragraph above.

- Students add transitional words and phrases.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

**What specific words and phrases in the more cohesive paragraph create effective transitions and contribute to cohesion?**

- Student responses should include:
  - “However”
  - “actually”
  - “and”
  - “These effects”
  - “Ultimately”
  - “which”
How does each transitional word or phrase contribute to the paragraph?

Student responses may include:

- The word “However” shows that ideas in this paragraph may be somewhat different from ideas in the previous paragraph.
- The word “actually” indicates that there is real support or evidence for the assertion that “extensive use [of technology] is harmful to the brain.”
- The word “and” shows that multitaskers suffer in more ways than one.
- The phrase “These effects” connect prior information to a new idea.
- The word “Ultimately” suggests that the paragraph or idea is coming to a conclusion.
- The word “which” indicates a cause and effect relationship between “excessive multitasking” and “inhibit[ed] intellectual development.”

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses. Explain to students that creating effective transitions is crucial to crafting a compelling argument. Effective use of transitional words and phrases improves the logical presentation of information and is important for making clear connections among the claims, evidence, and reasoning in an argument.
## Transitions Handout

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name:</th>
<th>Class:</th>
<th>Date:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Addition (to add an idea)</th>
<th>Illustration (to give an example)</th>
<th>Comparison (to show how ideas are similar)</th>
<th>Contrast (to show how ideas are different)</th>
<th>Explanation (to explain an idea)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>again</td>
<td>e.g., for example</td>
<td>equally in the same way</td>
<td>although at the same time</td>
<td>i.e., in other words that is</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>also</td>
<td>for instance</td>
<td>likewise</td>
<td>however</td>
<td>to clarify to explain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>besides</td>
<td>specifically</td>
<td>similarly</td>
<td>in contrast</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>finally</td>
<td>such as to demonstrate</td>
<td></td>
<td>nevertheless</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>first</td>
<td>to illustrate</td>
<td></td>
<td>nonetheless</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>furthermore</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>on the contrary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in addition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>otherwise</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lastly</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>yet</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>secondarily</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Emphasis (to highlight an idea)</th>
<th>Conclusion (to end a passage)</th>
<th>Cause and Effect (to show why)</th>
<th>Time (to show when and where)</th>
<th>Concession (to introduce counterclaims)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>especially</td>
<td>finally in conclusion</td>
<td>as a result</td>
<td>after</td>
<td>admittedly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>importantly</td>
<td>in the end</td>
<td>because</td>
<td>during</td>
<td>even so</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>indeed</td>
<td>lastly</td>
<td>consequently</td>
<td>meanwhile</td>
<td>granted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in fact</td>
<td>to conclude</td>
<td>for this reason</td>
<td>next</td>
<td>it is true</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of course</td>
<td></td>
<td>hence</td>
<td>simultaneously</td>
<td>of course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>significantly</td>
<td></td>
<td>so that</td>
<td>then</td>
<td>on the other hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>surely</td>
<td></td>
<td>therefore</td>
<td>when</td>
<td>regardless</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From Connecting Ideas Handout, by Odell Education, www.odelleducation.com. Copyright (2012–2013) by Odell Education. Adapted with permission under an Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported license: http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/
Reflect and Write

What are the benefits of isolating one area of focus in student work?

How does the use of supplemental instruction support the changes needed within curriculum?

What have you learned about equity and writing instruction?

What will you now go teach others?